



City of Sunnyvale

Meeting Minutes

Sustainability Commission

Thursday, November 30, 2023

6:30 PM

Online and Bay Conference Room
(Room 145), City Hall,
456 W. Olive Ave.,
Sunnyvale, CA 94086

Special Meeting: Joint Study Session of the Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Commission, Planning Commission and Sustainability Commission

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Kunz called the joint meeting to order at 6:36 p.m. in the Bay Conference Room (Room 145) at City Hall.

SALUTE TO THE FLAG

Chair Kunz led the salute to the flag.

ROLL CALL

Present: 17 - Chair Douglas Kunz
Vice Chair Tonya Veitch
Commissioner Kathryn Besser
Commissioner Bobbykin Makwana
Commissioner Jeffery Nabhan
Commissioner Kristina Pistone
Commissioner Kristel Wickham
Bryce Beagle
Dan Hafeman
Daniel Howard
Galen Kim Davis
Nathan Iglesias
Sharlene Liu
Leia Mehlman
Timothy Oey
Neela Shukla
Michael Serrone

Absent: 4 - Alex Bonne
Arwen Davé
Martin Pyne
John Howe

Planning Commission Vice Chair Iglesias arrived at 7:15 p.m.

Planning Commission Chair Pyne and Planning Commissioner Howe were absent.

BPAC Commissioner Dave and BPAC Commissioner Bonne were absent.

Council Liaison Melton and Council Liaison Din were absent.

STUDY SESSION

[23-1053](#) Review and discuss Draft Game Plan 2028. The complete draft can be downloaded at bit.ly/GamePlan28

Madeline Khair, Environmental Programs Manager, provided an overview of the Climate Action Playbook (CAP) carbon neutrality amendment, updated metrics and Draft Game Plan 2028. Ms. Khair concluded her presentation requesting that Commissioners first provide input on the new CAP carbon neutrality target, then metric updates and finally, discuss Draft Game Plan 2028 Strategies, Plays and Moves. Ms. Khair; Ramana Chinnakotla, Director of Environmental Services; and Melody Tovar, Regulatory Programs Division Manager provided answers to the Commissioner's questions.

Planning Commissioner Howard asked why emissions went up in 2019 and what feedback the City Council had to the proposed decrease in the vehicle miles traveled (VMT) CAP metric.

BPAC Chair Oey thanked staff for their progress on the CAP to-date. Chair Oey asked for a breakdown of the greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions for on-road transportation. He then asked staff to provide more detail on commercial gas and what uses make up the emissions in that sector. Chair Oey inquired if off-road equipment is solely lawn equipment or also construction equipment.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone asked staff to clarify what CO2 equivalent means, which greenhouse gases are tracked and what defines carbon neutrality.

Sustainability Commissioner Makwana asked what the process is for adding new Moves or updating current Moves in Game Plan 2028 during its five-year time frame. Staff clarified there is no process for updating the Game Plan once its adopted. Commissioner Makwana asked for the potential to amend Game Plan 2028 as new innovations and practices are emerging.

Planning Commissioner Davis thanked staff and supports the City adopting more aggressive GHG targets than the State. Commissioner Davis noted not being supportive of current methods used to calculate VMT. Commissioner Davis stated concern that the City's 2045 carbon neutrality target would require a significant lifestyle change in the community. Commissioner Davis advised that the City start talking about the upcoming lifestyle and land use impacts to bring awareness to the community.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman thanked staff for the presentation. Commissioner Mehlman suggested the City focus on micro-mobility infrastructure in Strategy 3: Decarbonizing Transportation & Sustainable Land Use and not solely on EV adoption. Commissioner Mehlman recommended adding a Move on micro-mobility. Commissioner Mehlman voiced concern on the focus of Strategy 4: Managing Resources Sustainably, being on reducing emissions from organics and not on reducing plastic or from other municipal solid waste streams. Commissioner Mehlman voiced concern that there is not enough in Draft Game Plan 2028 about transit infrastructure and recommended prioritizing transit infrastructure to make public transit options more accessible. Commissioner Mehlman recommended staff work with mobile home parks to help them electrify their homes.

BPAC Commissioner Hafeman asked if delivery vehicles are accounted for and affect commercial VMT data. Commissioner Hafeman asked if the CAP metric to increase on-road zero emission vehicle adoption to 42% by 2030 is for new vehicles only or all vehicles. Commissioner Hafeman voiced concern that car manufacturers may not be able to transition fast enough to all-electric fleet or acquire enough lithium to produce electric vehicles (EV) to meet our 2030 targets. Commissioner Hafeman recommended that staff focus more on reducing reliance on cars instead of replacing them with EV's.

Sustainability Commissioner Wickham commended staff for getting three

Commissions together to discuss Draft Game Plan 2028. Commissioner Wickham stated support of the new carbon neutrality target in Draft Game Plan 2028 to align with the State's 2045 target. Commissioner Wickham recommended several changes to the carbon neutrality language that could make the target stronger and more achievable. Sustainability Chair Kunz and Vice Chair Veitch supported these suggestions.

Planning Vice Chair Iglesias recommended staff include a metric to understand the costs on the City, residents or a combination to implement the targets stated in the Draft Game Plan 2028.

BPAC Chair Oey requested staff invest in real data to track VMT's in Sunnyvale and suggested using methods such as StreetLight data to track transportation instead of using estimates in the current methodology.

Sustainability Commissioner Wickham asked if the current CAP qualified for California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) streamlining purposes.

Sustainability Chair Kunz recommended staff continue to pursue qualifying the CAP for CEQA streamlining purposes.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone emphasized having better and stronger goals in Game Plan 2028 to help Sunnyvale achieve its targets. Commissioner Pistone recommended expanding the scope of Game Plan 2028 goals to include lifecycle impacts to bolster the City's efforts to reduce emissions.

Sustainability Chair Kunz opened discussion on the Strategy Plays and Ms. Khair responded to questions.

BPAC Chair Oey, BPAC Vice Chair Beagle, Planning Vice Chair Iglesias, Sustainability Commissioner Besser, and BPAC Commissioner Liu voiced concern about reducing the VMT per person target in Play 3.1.

BPAC Chair Oey asked whether tracking GHG emissions in transportation includes emissions from asphalt in parking lots and roadways.

Planning Commissioner Davis agreed with the landfill organics targets in Strategy 4: Managing Resources Sustainably.

Sustainability Commissioner Besser suggested increasing the Play 3.1 target slightly could encourage more people to strive for the higher goal and help the City achieve its true target of 10%. Commissioner Besser echoed statements previously made that EV adoption should not be the sole solution due to the cost barrier to purchase an EV as well as the worldwide impacts of lithium production.

BPAC Commissioner Liu suggested that staff account for emissions from EV production and usage, and asphalt creation and repaving when measuring GHG emissions in transportation. Commissioner Liu was concerned that the City is asking residents to switch from gas to electric vehicles, but not advocating for expanded public transit, bicycle routes and walkable streets. Commissioner Liu recommended staff work with the Transportation Division to require that all high-density housing projects include safe routes for residents that will live in the complexes to get around without a vehicle. Commissioner Liu asked the City to consider making this recommendation a policy.

Sustainability Commissioner Wickham voiced support for the new metrics in Strategy 2, 3 and 4. Commissioner Wickham emphasized liking that Strategy 2's metrics focus on natural gas use. Commissioner Wickham praised the percent reduction in landfill organics metric in Strategy 4 and asked if there could be further improvements to reduce landfill organics between 2030 and 2045.

Sustainability Commissioner Makwana asked to add the City's current status in meeting the metric targets in Game Plan 2028.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone noted support for increasing the percent of off-road zero emission equipment in Play 3.4. Commissioner Pistone suggested the metric come with a behavioral change framework to help move people away from unsustainable landscaping practices, such as gas-powered leaf blowers and lawn mowers.

BPAC Commissioner Hafeman asked if emissions from tires of cars or EVs are counted. Commissioner Hafeman asked if there is any discussion on measuring the percentage of people taking transit in Sunnyvale versus using single occupancy vehicles. Commissioner Hafeman suggested seeing the data on percentage of miles traveled on public transit in comparison to miles traveled in cars could be a helpful metric.

Sustainability Commissioner Makwana suggested an increase in the local battery

storage metric target for Play 1.3.

Sustainability Commissioner Nabhan was concerned to see the Strategy 4: Managing Resources Sustainably metric to reduce landfill garbage to one pound per person when it is currently at 3.6 pounds per person. Commissioner Nabhan asked if the data is trending that way and whether it would be feasible to meet.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman inquired how waste per person or per household is measured. Commissioner Mehlman asked if that calculation includes residential and commercial sources. Commissioner Mehlman questioned how construction waste is counted. Commissioner Mehlman asked the status of a commercial organics recycling program. Commissioner Mehlman inquired about compliance measures the City will be taking to ensure businesses are separating their organics. Commissioner Mehlman asked if hotel and motel residents' waste are captured in the calculation, if these residents are considered part of Sunnyvale's population and if they are required to separate organics during their stay.

BPAC Chair Oey expressed worry that Sunnyvale is unable to calculate the true total of GHGs and asked what percentage of total GHGs are outside of the City's scope. Chair Oey recommended including clarification in the CAP about GHG inventories being focused on Scope 1 emissions. Chair Oey emphasized that focusing on reducing VMTs in general could help the City reduce emissions in Scopes 1, 2 and 3 due to lower car sales, repaving and tire manufacturing.

Sustainability Chair Kunz voiced support on the new metrics that are being added and shared the same concerns about decreasing the VMT target.

Sustainability Chair Kunz opened discussion on the Strategy Moves and Ms. Khair guided the Commissioners on the structure staff would like to take feedback.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone asked for clarity on where the source of organics is coming from in Move 1.C.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman recommended for Strategy 1 or Strategy 2 that there be an added Move to implement solar panels in parking lots to reduce heat island effects and promote clean electricity generation and battery storage.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone asked for more clarity on why people would want to opt out of Silicon Valley Clean Energy's (SVCE) clean energy programs.

Sustainability Commissioner Wickham asked the status of the City's GreenPrime enrollment. Commissioner Wickham asked staff to get the City re-enrolled in GreenPrime.

Sustainability Chair Kunz opened the discussion on Strategy 2: Decarbonizing Buildings.

BPAC Vice Chair Beagle asked for an explanation on the difference between the terms decarbonization and zero emission.

BPAC Commissioner Hafeman expressed excitement for Move 2.H.

Planning Commissioner Davis supported the list of Moves in Strategy 2 and recommended staff work to switch residents with wood burning stoves to all-electric.

BPAC Chair Oey was pleased with the Moves listed in Strategy 2.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone and Vice Chair Veitch stated concern for renters as they do not have authority over electrifying their appliances. Commissioner Pistone called out that Moves 2.D, 2.F, 2.M and 2.I all encourage accelerated electrification adoption, but it is more difficult for renters to take advantage of these incentives without property manager support.

Sustainability Vice Chair Veitch recommended the municipal GHG inventory for Move 2.C be conducted every two or three years. Vice Chair Veitch suggested language changes to Move 2.M.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman inquired about the timeline to implement an ordinance for 2.G and requested there be no exemptions for manufactured home parks. Commissioner Mehlman additionally recommended staff design an assistance program for low-income households to bring them up to code.

Planning Vice Chair Iglesias recommended implementation costs be identified for each Move throughout Game Plan 2028 to prioritize the Moves that are cost-effective on residents and the City. BPAC Chair Oey supported this suggestion.

Sustainability Commissioner Wickham suggested the City prioritize designing an

awareness campaign to assist residents and businesses in electrifying their homes and buildings, specifically to help support the Bay Area Air Management District's (BAAQMD) ruling to ban natural gas water heater sales by 2027.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone asked why the local environmental quality icon in the community benefits section of Strategy 2 is identified for Move 2.J but not for Moves 2.D, 2.E and 2.G. Commissioner Pistone recommended staff monitor new enhancements to measuring methane leaks from existing buildings.

Sustainability Chair Kunz stated excitement for all new Moves in Strategy 2 and was particularly excited about Move 2.H. Chair Kunz stated uncertainty about the feasibility of reaching the 44% percent reduction goal in existing residential natural gas use by 2030. Chair Kunz asked how the set of tools in Moves 2.F, 2.L and 2.N fit together and suggested imbedding a diagram to show the course of action to achieve the 2030 target in Strategy 2.

Sustainability Chair Kunz opened the discussion on Strategy 3: Decarbonizing Transportation & Sustainable Land Use.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman asked what progress has been made on Move 3.A. Commissioner Mehlman recommended connecting and expanding the shuttle program identified in Move 3.F to other areas of the city to connect people to the VTA light rail and Caltrain.

BPAC Commissioner Liu requested that the supporting text in Moves 3.D and 3.I be more specific and quantify the high priority projects in the Active Transportation Plan (ATP).

Planning Commissioner Serrone articulated the barriers renters have to purchase an EV when their building does not have EV charging infrastructure and asked what triggers more EV chargers in multi-family buildings. Commissioner Serrone asked if the City can implement an ordinance to require EV chargers in new multi-family building projects. Commissioner Serrone mentioned that the State plans to ban the sale of natural gas-powered off-road equipment and asked staff if this will also ban the operation of them.

BPAC Commissioner Hafeman asked how the City plans to reduce street parking in Move 3.A to put more ATP infrastructure in. Commissioner Hafeman recommended modifying one of the Moves to include that existing street parking will be removed

after any new construction project is complete. Commissioner Hafeman also requested adding a new goal to Strategy 3 that seeks more funding for the City's ATP.

BPAC Chair Oey stated support for Move 3.I. Chair Oey requested the City install safer, more convenient bicycle lockers in existing parking lots. Chair Oey also suggested there be more emphasis on bicycle education and outreach in the Safe Routes to Schools program and in driver training programs. Chair Oey urged for more focus on funding in Game Plan 2028 and asked to better define "robust first and last mile" in Move 3.C.

Planning Vice Chair Iglesias expressed safety concerns to bike on the roads in Sunnyvale and suggested a more reliable and accessible public transit network around the city. Vice Chair Iglesias suggested imbedding a measurable goal in Strategy 3 to call out how long it should take people to get to and from a destination in Sunnyvale using alternatives modes of transportation.

BPAC Vice Chair Beagle strongly agreed with Vice Chair Iglesias, and emphasized that mode shift should be the focus of Strategy 3. Vice Chair Beagle suggested rephrasing Play 3.3 to increase the percentage of electric vehicles clarifying that the overall number of vehicles should decrease. Vice Chair Beagle asked for clarity on Move 3.J and how the largest employers in the city is defined. He recommended the City encourage companies to support transit through incentives. Vice Chair Beagle recommended Move 3.E include car share as an option.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman asked why the threshold for Move 3.E is 1,000 employees and not 500.

Planning Commissioner Howard recommended a shift in focus to promoting smaller EV equipment such as bicycles and scooters and utilizing retail spaces in Sunnyvale to promote the sale and use of micro mobility devices.

Planning Commissioner Davis supported Move 3.I and recommends creating more space on roadways for safe walking and biking routes.

Sustainability Commissioner Wickham questioned if the City's Specific Plans and Area Plans are enough to achieve the land use goals in Strategy 3 or if the City needed more zoning policies or higher density policies to implement.

Sustainability Chair Kunz opened the discussion on Strategy 4: Managing Resources Sustainably

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone asked if there is a plan to expand infrastructure to accept paper products in organics collection.

BPAC Commissioner Hafeman supported Move 4.I but suggests the Move also include residential construction projects. Commissioner Hafeman questioned why composting was left out of Strategy 4.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman requested that 4.K be seen as a high priority Move. Commissioner Mehlman suggested merging Moves 4.K and 4.J.

Sustainability Commissioner Wickham commented that Move 4.L is in need of funding. Commissioner Wickham went on to state the entire CAP needs funding and encouraged staff to think of creative ways to find the funding necessary to implement all of the Moves in Game Plan 2028. Chair Kunz supported these comments.

Planning Vice Chair Iglesias asked what a campaign looks like for Move 4.A.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone questioned how to encourage businesses like grocery stores to reduce plastic packaging and provide more sustainable options for consumers.

Sustainability Chair Veitch suggested including the potential to explore climate bonds or climate taxes to help fund the CAP. Vice Chair Veitch also suggested establishing more private-public partnerships for funding.

Sustainability Chair Kunz asked what Sunnyvale's Scope 3 emissions are and suggested establishing a consumption-based inventory to help the City identify target areas to drive policy changes.

Sustainability Chair Kunz opened the discussion on Strategy 5: Empowering Our Community and Strategy 6: Adapting to a Changing Climate.

BPAC Chair Oey stated support for Strategy 5 overall and encouraged more City recognition of residential demonstration projects. Chair Oey commented his support of the Sustainability Speaker Series.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman inquired about the work currently happening on Strategy 5 and suggested expanding the current environmental education programs to include more sustainability topics.

BPAC Commissioner Liu suggested adding a Move about incorporating Safe Routes to School in the elementary school curriculum.

Sustainability Commissioner Pistone commented that Governor Newsom signed Assembly Bill 285 to mandate climate change education in California in K-12 grade classrooms. Commissioner Pistone suggested rewording Move 6.C to make it clearer to understand what the intent is.

Sustainability Vice Chair Veitch voiced appreciation for Strategy 5. Vice Chair Veitch inquired about a way to integrate climate change information into the Community Emergency Response Team (CERT) Program. Vice Chair Veitch voiced excitement for Move 6.F and emphasized the importance of partnering with Non-Profit Organizations and Community Based Organizations to operate as resilience hubs.

BPAC Commissioner Mehlman inquired about strategies to achieve the Game Plan 2028 Moves, where the City's accountability is and if the City's budget can be altered to support the completion of the Moves in Game Plan 2028.

Sustainability Chair Kunz opened public comment.

Sustainability Chair Kunz closed public comment.

Sustainability Chair Kunz and Ms. Khair provided closing comments and thanked the Commissioners for attending the Joint Study Session on Draft Game Plan 2028.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 9:37 p.m.