Tiffany Court Sunnyvale CA 94087 May 11, 2016

Sunnyvale Planning Commission

Ref: Objection to second-story addition to home at 1169 Sesame Dr.

Dear Commission Members:

It was 1968 when we bought our Eichler home on Tiffany Court from its first owner. The reason it had caught our eye was that it had a big backyard, being situated at the end of a court, and we wanted a large yard where our children could run and play.

There was a large walnut tree on the left side of that backyard, close to the fence which marked the property line. On the other side of that fence was, of course, the backyard of another Eichler home. The first thing we did, as new owners, was to tear down a treehouse that the previous owner had built in that walnut tree for his children.

Almost immediately thereafter, we received a heart-felt "thank-you" from the neighbor on the other side of the fence near that tree. She explained that she and her family felt that their privacy had been grievously infringed upon when the treehouse was built because the children playing up there could see directly into, not only the neighbor's backyard, but their home as well (with its floor-to-ceiling Eichler windows).

I was appalled to think that the builder of that treehouse could be so oblivious to the discomfort it could bring to his neighbor.

We've enjoyed our Eichler home for close to five decades now. Though our end-of-acourt property borders at least five different neighbors, none of them can see into our yard from their home, and we can't see into theirs because all of us are living in one-story homes.

Since ours is a neighborhood of single-story homes featuring floor-to-ceiling windows, we are opposed to any remodel that adds a second story. We hope the planning commission can appreciate our concern that any rebuilding project in an Eichler neighborhood be limited to single-story designs. We all deserve privacy in our own homes. Wouldn't you agree?

Yours truly,

Jean Teter

From: Matt Cossoul

Sunnyvale CA 94087

To: Sunnyvale Planning Commission

Date: 5/11/2016

Subject: Objections on construction plan on 1169 Sesame Drive

Dear Planning Commission Members,

I am writing to you regarding the appeal of file # 2016-7031 related to the property on 1169 Sesame Drive.

Our family of five has been Sunnyvale residents since 2001, and the proud owner of an Eichler house in the Fairbrae Tract since 2008.

Our foremost concern is the damage this plan would do to our community, through the precedent it would set. Sunnyvale is extremely fortunate to be the city with the most Eichler houses in Northern California, and Fairbrae and the adjacent Tracts are, arguably, the crowd jewels. A perfect example of a thriving community appreciative and protective of Eichler's modern architecture legacy. Defending this community's desire to preserve this haven of classic modernism is not just in Sunnyvale's best interest - it's the right thing to do. The Eichler Guidelines, initiated by our Mayor, sent a strong message to our community that Sunnyvale has the preservation of those values at heart; allowing the current plan on 1169 Sesame Drive would be a contradiction that would set a dangerous precedent jeopardizing the perenity of this very community.

In addition, as it happens, two of our immediate neighbors have a two-story house (luckily for us their direct view to our backyard and open-design kitchen and living room is partially blocked by trees). This is not something we would wish to anyone. This is certainly not what the owners of our community were looking for when they elected to settle their families in this city, and the Fairbrae Tract.

I hope our concerns, which I know echos the opinion of the majority of our community, will be heard by the Commission. I am at your disposition should you wish to discuss those concerns.

Yours truly,
Matt Cossoul

Noren Caliva-Lepe

From: Sabina & Alessio Centazzo

Sent: Wednesday, May 11, 2016 6:53 AM

To: PlanningCommission@sunnyvale.ca.gov; Noren Caliva-Lepe; gcaruso@sunnyvale.ca.gov;

tryan@sunnyvale.ca.gov

Cc: Erik Petersen; John Sullivan

Subject:Letter in Objection to Project 1169 Sesame DriveAttachments:1169SesameDrive-LettertoPlanningCommission.pdf

Dear Planning Commission and Planning Department,

CC: Erik Peterson, John Sullivan

Please consider my input regarding FILE 2016-7031, 1169 Sesame Drive. We avoid writing a new brand message and we use a document (see attachment) created by one of our neighbors since it perfectly represents our opinion.

Best regards,

Sabina & Alessio Centazzo, 1161 Regia Ct, Sunnyvale CA 94087

Dear Planning Commission Members

I am writing to you regarding the appeal regarding 1169 Sesame Drive File#: 2016-7031

My name is Stephen Meier and I am a concerned neighbor at 595 Templeton Dr, in the Fairbrae Tract. I have lived at this location since 1992 and a resident of Sunnyvale since 1985.

I previously wrote to the planning department with comments in objection to the proposed development. While the applicant made several cosmetic changes to the home design the bulk of my objections still apply.

Summary: I object to the proposed project due to its invasion of privacy on neighbors, its size and mass projected to the front, its construction impacts, its violation of Eichler design guidelines and its potential to create a precedence which will lead to a series of massive 2 story rebuild project which will forever change the character of Fairbrae.

Lack of Community Involvement

It is unfortunate that the planning department approved the project without community involvement. We have lost the chance to review alternatives and seek a compromise and we have now entered a phase of binary and final decisions. 26 letters to object were written to the city which demonstrates significant community input. Why did the planning department not engage with this group to discuss this project?

The homeowners of Fairbrae would like to both welcome new neighbors, embrace new home construction and preserve our historic Eichler neighborhood.

After my letter the only communication that I received was that the project was approved. I had hoped for more discussion and community engagement to reach a decision.

Preamble - Examples of Excellent Projects

In preamble, I would like to thank both the Fairbrae neighbors and the planning department for excellent examples of new construction and remodels which have been completed are are in progress. Notable are the homes on 1119 Smyrna Ct and 627 Sheraton Drive. Smyrna is a remodel with expanding living space. Sheraton is a complete tear down and rebuild with modern construction but preserves original Eichler styling. These homes are beautiful and compatible with the Eichler style. It demonstrates that there are reasonable alternatives to the proposed project.

• 1119 Smyrna Ct - former home of Arthur Schwartz, remodel, expanded 1st floor living space using open part of deep lot.



• 627 Sheraton Dr - new construction, single floor eichler style



What both of these projects share is a preservation of the Eichler neighborhood unique style and consistency.

In addition to these projects there have been several recent new owners who have undertaken significant remodels while preserving the outer envelope without changes. In fact my new neighbors are in process of completing an interior remodel of their home. The vast majority of Eichler owners embrace the Eichler architecture and design and buy their homes because of it.

Guy Ayers (http://dguyayers.com/), the architect on this project clearly has demonstrated experience and talent to design within the Eichler guidelines. He has designed the wonderful homes at 1166 Quince Ave and 1104 N Sage Ct. These homes are complete new construction but maintain strong faith to Eichler design principles.

The vast majority of owners in Fairbrae embrace the Eichler style and prefer that the neighborhood remain true to its character and vision of Joseph Eichler.

Preamble - Examples of Undesirable Projects

This house on Vanderbilt was recently remodeled and does not follow Eichler Design Guidelines. There is a large balcony above the roof and a large set of glass windows.



Objections to 1169 Sesame - Detailed Discussion

Next I would like to express my objections to this project as summarized in the following bullet points:

- 1. Privacy
- 2. Size
- 3. Sunnyvale Eichler Guidelines
- 4. Construction Impacts
- 5. Historical Preservation
- 6. Precedence

Overall the proposed project is a beautiful modern design, it is just not appropriate for the Eichler Fairbrae neighborhood.

1. Privacy

The 2nd story with outside balconies (deck) creates sight lines directly into neighbors back yards and living spaces.

The Eichler design guidelines specifically prohibit outdoor balconies.

- 3.3.3 Avoid windows looking into adjacent homes' windows and private outdoor space.
 - a) Locate large windows mainly to the front of the house whenever possible.
 - b) Limit second floor windows where they would provide views into adjacent homes' living space windows and private outdoor space. Windows larger than the minimum required for emergency egress are strongly discouraged along the sides and rear of the home. Whenever possible, windows should be clerestory or frosted and textured glass.
 - c) Avoid second floor balconies and bay windows on side and rear elevations.

Having an outside deck creates an invasion of privacy and potential for noise to be projected into a neighbor's yard.

The modification of adding planting boxes is no way sufficient to mitigate the impact of outdoor balconies. Planter boxes are temporary and easily removed or modified to provide sight lines.

Loss of privacy has a huge negative impact on neighbors which cannot be mitigated. It compromises someone lifestyle if they cannot engage privately in their own home without the risk of being observed by strangers.

2. Size / Mass

The size of the house, and specifically the size and massing of the house to the front side facing the street is out of character with the neighborhood. Sesame Dr is composed of only single story flat roof Eichler's. This nice continuous flat line would be interrupted by this imposing structure in the middle of the street.

The Eichler design guidelines Sec 3.7 state:

Common problems and concerns with new houses in Eichler neighborhoods * Tall and bulky building forms which strongly contrast with the low profile Eichler homes.

As I mentioned in my previous letter there could be alternatives which would afford equal square footage but would have less impact on the character of the neighborhood. The lot is very deep and there is ample room to build a large 1 story home to meet desirable square footage.

Large 2 story homes and flat roof single story homes do not mix well. Here is an example of a similar sized home on 1623 Wright Avenue and how it appears adjacent to single story eichlers. The abrupt change in height clearly breaks a continuous horizontal line. This is highly disruptive to the architecture and look of the neighborhood.



3. Eichler Design Guidelines

This project is clearly in violation of a number of Eichler guidelines. We need the Planning Department and the Planning Commission to embrace and support the hard work which went into establishing these guidelines.

This project does not meet Eichler guidelines because its large size related to its adjacent one story homes.

From Eichler Design Guidelines:

- 3.7.1 Incorporate a Modernist Style sympathetic to the forms and style of the Eichler homes nearby.
- c) Provide a strong horizontal emphasis to the home design.
- 3.7.2 Use building volumes that are compatible with the surrounding Eichler neighborhood.
- a) One-story homes will be easier to fit into Eichler neighborhoods than two-story houses.

b) If a two-story house is proposed:

- Limit floor-to-floor heights to a maximum of 10 feet.
- Provide large second floor roof overhangs of at least 3 feet.
- Provide some detail elements at the second floor line to relate to the one story

height of nearby Eichler homes. Some techniques include:

- * Deeply recessed garage doors.
 - * One-story elements forward of two-story walls.
 - * Horizontal projecting bands
 - * Trellis elements

Here are current views from north and south. Both sides of Sesame are continuous line of single story Eichler homes.

Sesame Dr view view from North:



Sesame Drive View from South



Sesame drive has continuous single story story sight lines and architectural lines with flat roofs for entire block on both sides of the street. I enjoy a view to the sunset to the west as I take my daily walks.

4. Construction Impacts

Due to its large size and its basement, this project will involve a lengthy construction period and there will be serious impact to the quality of life and health impacts to neighbors due to noise, air pollution and construction vehicles. A basement of that size requires excavation which will cause noise and vibration in adjacent Eichler homes. The soil must be removed and the construction materials must be brought in. All of that construction activity creates toxic pollution which will negatively affect my health.

I feel there has not been adequate discussion on these impacts and that neighbors will be surprised at the negative impacts.

These impacts could be reduced if a more modest single story footprint was selected.

For reference here is an example from 2-story home development in midtown Palo Alto.



As a neighborhood resident I would be willing to put up with the construction impacts if we were to preserve and improve the neighborhood. I am not willing to put my health at risk for a project which violates Eichler Design Guidelines.

6. Architectural and Historical Preservation

The Fairbrae track is of historical significance given that it is a well preserved early track of Eichler homes. It is highlighted on a number of websites and in modern design architecture books. See Eichler Homes: Design for Living by <u>Jerry Ditto</u>, <u>Lanning Stern</u>, <u>Marvin Wax</u>, <u>Sally B. Woodbridge</u>.

In fact one real estate website states that:

Fairbrae and Fairbrae Addition are well-maintained Eichler neighborhoods whose homes are based on a variety of floor plans, ranging from a few smaller 3-bedroom 2-bath homes to many larger 4-bedroom homes ranging from 1475 square feet to over 1700 square feet of living space.

The Mid-century character in Fairbrae is protected by Sunnyvale's Eichler Design Guidelines, which involves a number of Sunnyvale's Eichler communities including <u>Fairwood</u>, Fairpark, <u>Rancho Verde</u>, and <u>Rancho Sans Souci</u>. https://www.eichlerforsale.com/fairbrae-eichlers.php

Architectural preservation is important not just to preserve history, but it is proven to make a significant difference in home value appreciation. If you approve this project you will have a negative on home valuations and expose the City of Sunnyvale to litigation from negatively affected Fairbrae residents.

6. Precedence

With a robust economy and local industry there is a high demand for luxury housing. Fairbrae, due to its prime location and excellent schools is an attractive neighborhood for affluent families. By approving this project, the Sunnyvale planning department is creating a precedent by which other buyers can justify purchasing a home and building a massive 2 story home in its place.

In this situation the subject parcel was sold 3/27/2015 for \$1,961,000. And then within a short timeframe there is a project planned for new construction of a massive 2 story home.

If this project goes forward then it will be cited as a precedent for additional large, non Eichler homes in the Fairbrae tract.

Fairbrae residents would like our neighborhood to remain in its current character of mostly single story Eichler style homes.

Summary

The planning department has an excellent track record in approving Eichler compatible projects with 1119 Smyrna Ct, 627 Sheraton Dr, 1166 Quince Ave, 1104 N Sage Ct. and numerous other remodel projects. One exception is the Vanderbilt project.

Alternatives exist with the same architect to design and build a contemporary modern home which both meets the total square feet and retains the single story Eichler design and preserves the neighborhood. If the lot size was small there would be a demonstrated need for a 2-story. But given the large lot size it should be possible to build 1 story and preserve the neighborhood. Guy Ayers designs of Sage and Quince homes demonstrate that new construction magnificent Eichler like homes can be achieved.

For the sake of neighborhood community and historic architecture preservation I request that you reject the proposed project for 1169 Sesame Drive and suggest the homeowners to submit an alternate project which is compatible with the neighborhood and meets Eichler design guidelines.

Philippe Cailloux

Sunnyvale, CA 94087

May 11, 2016 in Sunnyvale

City of Sunnyvale, Planning Commission 456 W Olive Ave Sunnyvale, CA 94086

Object: objection to the construction project at 1169 Sesame Drive

Dear Planning Commission Members,

My name is Philippe Cailloux, owner of an Eichler Home in the Sunnyvale Fairbrae neighborhood since 2000.

I am writing this letter to object to the construction project located at 1169 Sesame Drive, Sunnyvale under the file number 20167031 because the proposed architecture

- Breaks the Eichler Home design guidelines
- Breaks the integrity of the carefully designed Eichler Neighborhoods
- Negatively impacts the community aspect of an Eichler neighborhood by invading surrounding Eichler homes privacy
- Creates a precedent

I welcome new neighbors but, like many Eichler homeowners, I have learned to appreciate and respect the very unique nature of the architectures of the homes themselves and that of their neighborhoods.

The current Eichler design guidelines are an excellent start and they need to be enforced and extended in some aspects such as privacy protection and restriction of second stories.

Thank you for your attention in the matter.

Sincerely,

Philippe Cailloux

Noren Caliva-Lepe

From: Peter Anning

Sent: Wednesday, May 11, 2016 6:35 PM

To: ncaliva-lepe@sunnyvale.ca.gov; tryan@sunnyvale.ca.gov

Subject: 1169 Sesame Drive

Dear Noren and Trudy:

The purpose of this letter is to respond to your April 11, 2016 notification of the Design Review Approval for the 1169 Sesame Drive proposal.

As a 55-year resident of the Eichler Fairbrae neighborhood, residing at 673 Torrington Drive, and within the 300-foot radius of the proposed new construction at 1169 Sesame Dr., I have real concerns about the design of the house, its size, and the way the city interpreted its own architectural guidelines when approving the home's design.

From all I can tell, the proposed home would be beautiful architecturally. Modern, light-filled and energy efficient. That's all wonderful if the plan was to build the home in a new development or in a rural setting. But the homes adjacent to 1169 Sesame Dr. are classic Eichler models, with nearly full back walls of glass. The architect who designed for Eichler did so with an eye toward privacy as well as light and a blending of indoor and outdoor spaces. To that end, the homes have a limited number and size of windows in front, but the rear of these homes is almost entirely glass. Any second-story addition or new construction with a second story will most certainly create site lines into the living rooms, kitchens, family rooms and bedrooms of its neighbors, adversely affecting the character of the back yard and back-of-the-home activities as well as the comfort and sense of privacy of those residents. These issues have been successfully addressed by other developers by either adding floor space below ground, or limiting the height of construction within site lines of existing Eichler neighborhood homes.

And then there is the size of the proposed new construction. Even with a full or partial basement, the 3,000 square foot design is immense. It will not fit within the character and scale of the neighborhood, dwarfing all neighboring homes while blocking site lines and sun light penetration. In common terms, "it will stick out like a sore thumb."

Regarding the city's own Eichler Design Guidelines, it's hard to fathom how the proposed design was even compared against this document as it is so far off spec. I remember the stress and outrage when an Eichler home was demolished and replaced with a 'Tuscanized' monster home on Wright Ave. Then, as now, the adjacent neighbors were up in arms. Their privacy was not considered, the home's architecture had zero relation of the other homes on the street, and no amount of creative landscaping could hide or diminish the view of this intrusive design. I believe the neighborhood uproar was the catalyst that got the City of Sunnyvale to propose, review and produce the Eichler Design Guidelines, which I fully supported. Now, it appears the very same guidelines that were written to protect these historic neighborhoods with consistent designs, building heights, and privacy addressed, has been ignored almost entirely.

I would love to welcome new neighbors to the Fairbrae Community; however, if those new neighbors see nothing wrong with destroying the peaceful existence of their adjacent community members, I am far less than enthusiastic about their arrival in the neighborhood. If those same new neighbors found

Attachment 7

the home that they purchased to be incompatible with their space needs and lifestyle, then have to wonder and ask "Why'd they buy the house in the first place??!" There are other homes for sale throughout the region with more than enough space for people who want a sizable home and yard.

So, the design of the proposed new construction at 1169 Sesame is incompatible with the neighborhood architecture and the privacy needs and expectations of its adjacent residents. The sheer size of the proposed construction will block light and views on all four its sides, and be an intrusive mass on the street of one-story homes. Finally, if the City of Sunnyvale took the time to propose, develop, seek input, gain approval, write and finalize Eichler Design Guidelines, then it is incumbent upon the city to actually use and enforce those guidelines for the benefit of everyone, now and into the future.

Thank you for taking the time to review this emailed message. I will be in attendance at the Monday, May 16th Planning Commission hearing on this matter.

Sincerely,

Peter Anning

Sunnyvale CA 94087

Dear Planning Commission Members

I am writing to you regarding the appeal of file number 2016-7031 related to the property on 1169 Sesame Drive.

My husband, Giovanni Sena and I live on 1218 Sesame Ct. We have lived at this location since 2003 and we have been Sunnyvale residents since 2002.

We object to the proposed project due to the invasion of privacy on neighbors, the size of the house and the violation of Eichler Design guidelines.

We are also concerned about the precedent that this home will create and it could have impact to the entire neighborhood.

Sesame Drive all the way thru Sesame Court, where we live, is a homogenous continuum of single story flat roof Eichler. This nice continuous flat line would be interrupted by this imposing structure in the middle of the street. The beauty and the value of Sesame Drive would be definitely impacted.

The overall Fairbrae tract has preserving a historical character of Eichler homes. The area is praised in the community and appreciated by Eichler lovers. Architecture preservation is important as it creates a sense in the community. Community gather to talk about their passion about these homes. Architecture preservation is also important to keep for future generations.

The community spent a large amount of public efforts to create the Eichler guidelines. I am really surprised that the City will allow a home to be built in violation of the guidelines that the City developed and also in violation of the spirit of the Eichler home character.

We are not against rebuilding homes. There are some very good example of tearing down and rebuilding homes preserving the Eichler character.

We request that you reject the proposed project for 1169 Sesame Drive. We suggest the homeowners to submit an alternate project which is compatible with the neighborhood and meets Eichler design quidelines.

Regards

Giovanni Sena and Monica Orlando

Dear Planning Commission Members

I am writing to you regarding the appeal of file number 2016-7031 related to the property on 1169 Sesame Drive.

My name is François Cornillon and I live on 622 Torrington Drive, in the Fairbrae Tract. I have lived at this location since 2004.

Summary:

I object to the proposed project due to:

- 1. Its invasion to privacy on neighbors,
- 2. Violation of Eichler design guidelines,
- 3. Precedence.
- 4. Historic theme, culture and architectural preservation of Sunnyvale,

1. Privacy

A two story home with outside balconies creates direct sight line into neighbors' back yards and living spaces, resulting in visual intrusion. Back yard fences respect each other's privacy allowing people to live in harmony, which a 2nd story directly violates.

2. Eichler Design Guidelines

The City of Sunnyvale spent of a lot of time, effort and resources in creating and issuing design guidelines to respect both the architectural and harmony of Fairbrae Eichler neighborhood. The Eichler design guidelines specifically prohibit outdoor balconies and yet, the proposed construction directly violates that guideline. So, why spending all of this effort to release guidelines if in the end, they are not followed? Eichler Design Guidelines is the first document listed under the Sunnyvale Historical Resource Information Section on its webpage outlining how important it is to the City and the Community. It can be viewed here:

http://sunnyvale.ca.gov/CityGovernment/BoardsandCommissions/HeritagePreservationCommission.aspx

3. Precedence

The beautiful Eichler property located on 1169 Sesame Drive was sold on March 27th of this year for \$1,961,000 and within a short timeframe, a project is being proposed to demolish it for a construction of a massive new 2nd story home that would double in volume compared to the adjacent Eichler properties. If that project goes through, it will set a precedent, which will ultimately see the disappearance of what constitute a part of history of Sunnyvale. That seems to be in contradiction with the efforts of the City to preserve and emphasizes its unique cultural heritage. Culture is what defines society and how people live together.

4. Historical Preservation

The City of Sunnyvale issued and released a Historical Context Statement relating with great details how Sunnyvale was shaped from the early days back in 1777 to the Twentieth Century. Eichler tracts and developments are taking an important place reflecting the rich cultural heritage of the City. People buy and live in Eichler because of that cultural heritage. It is also important to keep that heritage intact to transmit to future generations. Demolishing Eichler homes to build two story massive new constructions contribute to the disappearance of that cultural heritage. It is in contradiction with the effort the City is putting to keep its heritage that makes Sunnyvale unique. Architecture preservation helps us better understand how the City evolved over time. It is also a key pillar in creating a sense of community. The Historical Context Statement document can be viewed here: http://sunnyvale.ca.gov/Portals/0/Sunnyvale/CDD/ContextStatementofSunnyvale2014.pd f

I request that you reject the proposed project for 1169 Sesame Drive. I suggest that the homeowners to submit an alternate project, which is compatible with the neighborhood privacy, meet the Eichler design guidelines and maintain the cultural heritage of Eichler homes.

Dear Planning Commission Members

I am writing to you regarding the appeal of file number 2016-7031 related to the property on 1169 Sesame Drive.

My name is Bertrand Chevalier and I live on 1124 Spinosa Drive, in the Fairbrae Tract. I have lived at this location since 2003.

I already provided my objection to the planning department. I am glad that the Planning Department took into consideration several of my inputs. But despite the changes done, I am still opposed to this project as there are still some concerns to be addressed.

I am concerned with the invasion of privacy on neighbors, the aesthetic of the home on the front yard and its violations of the Eichler Design guidelines.

I am also concerned about the precedent that this home will create that could impact the entire neighborhood.

Let me highlight some of my points:

The Eichler Fairbae tract have all homes in similar sizes. Adding a massive home will impact the overall neighborhood appearance. Eichler guidelines prohibit "Tall and bulky building forms which strongly contrast with the low profile Eichler homes."

Eichler guidelines also states that "Use building volumes that are compatible with the surrounding Eichler neighborhood." The street has one story houses so two stories home are not compatible.

Eichler guidelines state that windows need to be limited to protect privacy and that balconies are prohibited. But this home is not following the guidelines.

The Fairbrae tract has preserving a historical character of Eichler homes. The area is praised in the community and appreciated by Eichler lovers. Architecture preservation is important as it creates a sense in the community. Community gather to talk about their passion about these homes. Architecture preservation is also important to keep for future generations.

The community spent a large amount of public efforts to create the Eichler guidelines. I am really surprised that the City will allow a home to be built in violation of the guidelines that the City developed and also in violation of the spirit of the Eichler home character.

I am not against rebuilding homes. There are some very good example of tearing down and rebuilding home preserving the Eichler character as on 627 Sheraton Drive.

I request that you reject the proposed project for 1169 Sesame Drive. I suggest that the homeowners to submit an alternate project which is compatible with the neighborhood and meets Eichler design guidelines.

I will be travelling overseas during the public hearing so please use my inputs from this letter.

Dear Planning Commission Members,

I am writing to you regarding the appeal of file number 20167031 related to the property on 1169 Sesame Drive. I am also concerned about the precedent that this home will create that could have impact to the entire neighborhood.

I am Lynn Bos and I live on 1128 Spinosa Drive, in the Fairbrae Tract. I bought this house in August 2014 for a premium price because of its Eichler nature.

My concern is two-fold: 1) affecting the aesthetics of the community and privacy of the neighbors due to the second story and eventually causing a depreciation for the entire neighborhood, 2) not preserving the historical character of Eichler homes.

Exactly for this second reason, Eichler Design guidelines have been composed by the city and have been respected by most in this neighborhood.

- Eichler guidelines prohibit "Tall and bulky building forms which strongly contrast with the low profile Eichler homes."
- Eichler guidelines state that windows need to be limited to protect privacy and that balconies are prohibited. But this home is not following the guidelines.
- Eichler guidelines also states that "Use building volumes that are compatible with the surrounding Eichler neighborhood." The street has one story houses so two stories home are not compatible.

I hope you will reject the proposed project for 1169 Sesame Drive and demand the homeowners to submit an alternate project which is compatible with the neighborhood and meets Eichler design.

Sincerely, Lynn Bos May 10, 2016

Sunnyvale Planning Commission
Larry Klein
Russ Melton
Noren Caliva-Lepe, Project Planner for 1169 Sesame Drive
Trudi Ryan, Community Development Director
Gerri Caruso

Dear Friends and Leaders of Sunnyvale:

The purpose of this letter is to provide comments on the 1169 Sesame Drive project in advance of the special 16 May Planning Commission meeting. We appreciate having the ability to provide our inputs to you. We have lived at this address for 26 years. The City of Sunnyvale is a wonderful place in which to live.

As described, the project involves complete demolition of the existing structure and construction of a new, very large, two-story home with full basement. **We strongly object to the construction of this new home as described in the proposed plans.** Our Fairbrae neighborhood is comprised to a very large extent of single-story Eichler homes. The design of these homes is why we and so many of our neighbors have chosen to live here.

The Sunnyvale zoning requirements for additions or new construction of single-family homes include the following design principles:

- **"• RESPECT THE SCALE, BULK AND CHARACTER OF HOMES IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD**
- DESIGN HOMES TO RESPECT THEIR IMMEDIATE NEIGHBORS"

The proposed design violates both of these principles. Privacy issues are being well addressed by the comments from neighbors directly adjacent to the property. Our primary concern is the "scale, bulk, and character" of the proposed project. The proposed new home contains more than double the living space of each of the neighboring homes and conflicts with the inherent nature of the Eichler designs.

More specifically, the City of Sunnyvale Eichler Design Guidelines adopted July 28, 2009 apply to this proposed new home. We were involved in the process for developing these guidelines and trust that the City of Sunnyvale will treat them seriously and apply them judiciously. One of the intents of these guidelines is to:

"Preserve the unique character of Eichler homes and their neighborhood."

The proposed design runs contrary to this intent as you can readily observe from the details of the plans and the associated comments from neighbors.

.

We are convinced that the City of Sunnyvale, through its permit processes, would carefully monitor the proposed demolition and construction activity. We are not well enough qualified to comment on the design and construction details.

However, in the event that the proposed project is accepted, we are well aware of the Sunnyvale municipal codes concerning noise and hours of construction and will help ensure that these requirements are met.

On a more human level, the next-door neighbor to the proposed project (Mr. Howard Gaines of 1175 Sesame Drive) is an 87-year-old gentleman who has recently lost his wife, and lives alone with his dog, Goldie. We are certain that he would never complain about his health and safety, but we are very concerned about the impact that this project would have on his welfare.

Once again, we appreciate this opportunity to comment on the proposed project. Thank you for your efforts to ensure that proper actions are taken.

Very truly yours,

Edwin W and Jean D Aiken Trustee

Sunnyvale, CA 94087-2445

Dear Planning Commission Members

I am writing to you regarding the appeal regarding 1169 Sesame Drive File#: 2016-7031

My name is Stephen Meier and I am a concerned neighbor at 595 Templeton Dr, in the Fairbrae Tract. I have lived at this location since 1992 and a resident of Sunnyvale since 1985.

I previously wrote to the planning department with comments in objection to the proposed development. While the applicant made several cosmetic changes to the home design the bulk of my objections still apply.

Summary: I object to the proposed project due to its invasion of privacy on neighbors, its size and mass projected to the front, its construction impacts, its violation of Eichler design guidelines and its potential to create a precedence which will lead to a series of massive 2 story rebuild project which will forever change the character of Fairbrae.

Lack of Community Involvement

It is unfortunate that the planning department approved the project without community involvement. We have lost the chance to review alternatives and seek a compromise and we have now entered a phase of binary and final decisions. 26 letters to object were written to the city which demonstrates significant community input. Why did the planning department not engage with this group to discuss this project?

The homeowners of Fairbrae would like to both welcome new neighbors, embrace new home construction and preserve our historic Eichler neighborhood.

After my letter the only communication that I received was that the project was approved. I had hoped for more discussion and community engagement to reach a decision.

Preamble - Examples of Excellent Projects

In preamble, I would like to thank both the Fairbrae neighbors and the planning department for excellent examples of new construction and remodels which have been completed are are in progress. Notable are the homes on 1119 Smyrna Ct and 627 Sheraton Drive. Smyrna is a remodel with expanding living space. Sheraton is a complete tear down and rebuild with modern construction but preserves original Eichler styling. These homes are beautiful and compatible with the Eichler style. It demonstrates that there are reasonable alternatives to the proposed project.

• 1119 Smyrna Ct - former home of Arthur Schwartz, remodel, expanded 1st floor living space using open part of deep lot.



• 627 Sheraton Dr - new construction, single floor eichler style



What both of these projects share is a preservation of the Eichler neighborhood unique style and consistency.

In addition to these projects there have been several recent new owners who have undertaken significant remodels while preserving the outer envelope without changes. In fact my new neighbors are in process of completing an interior remodel of their home. The vast majority of Eichler owners embrace the Eichler architecture and design and buy their homes because of it.

Guy Ayers (http://dguyayers.com/), the architect on this project clearly has demonstrated experience and talent to design within the Eichler guidelines. He has designed the wonderful homes at 1166 Quince Ave and 1104 N Sage Ct. These homes are complete new construction but maintain strong faith to Eichler design principles.

The vast majority of owners in Fairbrae embrace the Eichler style and prefer that the neighborhood remain true to its character and vision of Joseph Eichler.

Preamble - Examples of Undesirable Projects

This house on Vanderbilt was recently remodeled and does not follow Eichler Design Guidelines. There is a large balcony above the roof and a large set of glass windows.



Objections to 1169 Sesame - Detailed Discussion

Next I would like to express my objections to this project as summarized in the following bullet points:

- 1. Privacy
- 2. Size
- 3. Sunnyvale Eichler Guidelines
- 4. Construction Impacts
- 5. Historical Preservation
- 6. Precedence

Overall the proposed project is a beautiful modern design, it is just not appropriate for the Eichler Fairbrae neighborhood.

1. Privacy

The 2nd story with outside balconies (deck) creates sight lines directly into neighbors back yards and living spaces.

The Eichler design guidelines specifically prohibit outdoor balconies.

- 3.3.3 Avoid windows looking into adjacent homes' windows and private outdoor space.
 - a) Locate large windows mainly to the front of the house whenever possible.
 - b) Limit second floor windows where they would provide views into adjacent homes' living space windows and private outdoor space. Windows larger than the minimum required for emergency egress are strongly discouraged along the sides and rear of the home. Whenever possible, windows should be clerestory or frosted and textured glass.
 - c) Avoid second floor balconies and bay windows on side and rear elevations.

Having an outside deck creates an invasion of privacy and potential for noise to be projected into a neighbor's yard.

The modification of adding planting boxes is no way sufficient to mitigate the impact of outdoor balconies. Planter boxes are temporary and easily removed or modified to provide sight lines.

Loss of privacy has a huge negative impact on neighbors which cannot be mitigated. It compromises someone lifestyle if they cannot engage privately in their own home without the risk of being observed by strangers.

2. Size / Mass

The size of the house, and specifically the size and massing of the house to the front side facing the street is out of character with the neighborhood. Sesame Dr is composed of only single story flat roof Eichler's. This nice continuous flat line would be interrupted by this imposing structure in the middle of the street.

The Eichler design guidelines Sec 3.7 state:

Common problems and concerns with new houses in Eichler neighborhoods * Tall and bulky building forms which strongly contrast with the low profile Eichler homes.

As I mentioned in my previous letter there could be alternatives which would afford equal square footage but would have less impact on the character of the neighborhood. The lot is very deep and there is ample room to build a large 1 story home to meet desirable square footage.

Large 2 story homes and flat roof single story homes do not mix well. Here is an example of a similar sized home on 1623 Wright Avenue and how it appears adjacent to single story eichlers. The abrupt change in height clearly breaks a continuous horizontal line. This is highly disruptive to the architecture and look of the neighborhood.



3. Eichler Design Guidelines

This project is clearly in violation of a number of Eichler guidelines. We need the Planning Department and the Planning Commission to embrace and support the hard work which went into establishing these guidelines.

This project does not meet Eichler guidelines because its large size related to its adjacent one story homes.

From Eichler Design Guidelines:

- 3.7.1 Incorporate a Modernist Style sympathetic to the forms and style of the Eichler homes nearby.
- c) Provide a strong horizontal emphasis to the home design.
- 3.7.2 Use building volumes that are compatible with the surrounding Eichler neighborhood.
- a) One-story homes will be easier to fit into Eichler neighborhoods than two-story houses.

b) If a two-story house is proposed:

- Limit floor-to-floor heights to a maximum of 10 feet.
- Provide large second floor roof overhangs of at least 3 feet.
- Provide some detail elements at the second floor line to relate to the one story

height of nearby Eichler homes. Some techniques include:

- * Deeply recessed garage doors.
 - * One-story elements forward of two-story walls.
 - * Horizontal projecting bands
 - * Trellis elements

Here are current views from north and south. Both sides of Sesame are continuous line of single story Eichler homes.

Sesame Dr view view from North:



Sesame Drive View from South



Sesame drive has continuous single story story sight lines and architectural lines with flat roofs for entire block on both sides of the street. I enjoy a view to the sunset to the west as I take my daily walks.

4. Construction Impacts

Due to its large size and its basement, this project will involve a lengthy construction period and there will be serious impact to the quality of life and health impacts to neighbors due to noise, air pollution and construction vehicles. A basement of that size requires excavation which will cause noise and vibration in adjacent Eichler homes. The soil must be removed and the construction materials must be brought in. All of that construction activity creates toxic pollution which will negatively affect my health.

I feel there has not been adequate discussion on these impacts and that neighbors will be surprised at the negative impacts.

These impacts could be reduced if a more modest single story footprint was selected.

For reference here is an example from 2-story home development in midtown Palo Alto.



As a neighborhood resident I would be willing to put up with the construction impacts if we were to preserve and improve the neighborhood. I am not willing to put my health at risk for a project which violates Eichler Design Guidelines.

6. Architectural and Historical Preservation

The Fairbrae track is of historical significance given that it is a well preserved early track of Eichler homes. It is highlighted on a number of websites and in modern design architecture books. See Eichler Homes: Design for Living by <u>Jerry Ditto</u>, <u>Lanning Stern</u>, <u>Marvin Wax</u>, <u>Sally B. Woodbridge</u>.

In fact one real estate website states that:

Fairbrae and Fairbrae Addition are well-maintained Eichler neighborhoods whose homes are based on a variety of floor plans, ranging from a few smaller 3-bedroom 2-bath homes to many larger 4-bedroom homes ranging from 1475 square feet to over 1700 square feet of living space.

The Mid-century character in Fairbrae is protected by Sunnyvale's Eichler Design Guidelines, which involves a number of Sunnyvale's Eichler communities including <u>Fairwood</u>, Fairpark, <u>Rancho Verde</u>, and <u>Rancho Sans Souci</u>. https://www.eichlerforsale.com/fairbrae-eichlers.php

Architectural preservation is important not just to preserve history, but it is proven to make a significant difference in home value appreciation. If you approve this project you will have a negative on home valuations and expose the City of Sunnyvale to litigation from negatively affected Fairbrae residents.

6. Precedence

With a robust economy and local industry there is a high demand for luxury housing. Fairbrae, due to its prime location and excellent schools is an attractive neighborhood for affluent families. By approving this project, the Sunnyvale planning department is creating a precedent by which other buyers can justify purchasing a home and building a massive 2 story home in its place.

In this situation the subject parcel was sold 3/27/2015 for \$1,961,000. And then within a short timeframe there is a project planned for new construction of a massive 2 story home.

If this project goes forward then it will be cited as a precedent for additional large, non Eichler homes in the Fairbrae tract.

Fairbrae residents would like our neighborhood to remain in its current character of mostly single story Eichler style homes.

Summary

The planning department has an excellent track record in approving Eichler compatible projects with 1119 Smyrna Ct, 627 Sheraton Dr, 1166 Quince Ave, 1104 N Sage Ct. and numerous other remodel projects. One exception is the Vanderbilt project.

Alternatives exist with the same architect to design and build a contemporary modern home which both meets the total square feet and retains the single story Eichler design and preserves the neighborhood. If the lot size was small there would be a demonstrated need for a 2-story. But given the large lot size it should be possible to build 1 story and preserve the neighborhood. Guy Ayers designs of Sage and Quince homes demonstrate that new construction magnificent Eichler like homes can be achieved.

For the sake of neighborhood community and historic architecture preservation I request that you reject the proposed project for 1169 Sesame Drive and suggest the homeowners to submit an alternate project which is compatible with the neighborhood and meets Eichler design guidelines.

Noren Caliva-Lepe

From: Lance Cushenberry

Sent: Sunday, May 08, 2016 2:13 PM

To: planning@sunnyvale.ca.gov; ncaliva-lepe@ci.sunnyvale.ca.us

Cc: M L; Joyce

Subject: City of Sunnyvale Public Notice for 1169 Sesame Drive, Sunnyvale

Attachments: 16-7031.pdf; Untitled attachment 00034.htm

Noren

Our neighborhood needs to be protected from monster houses which will forever change the integrity of our Eichler neighborhood. Two story houses do not belong in this neighborhood. This allows the new house to interrupt the single story intent of the original plan.

It will create an arms race by others to tear down and build more monster houses. We settled in this neighborhood because of the single story nature of the area. We enjoy the privacy it affords. Allowing folks who can afford to spend millions of dollars to change the neighborhood is sending the wrong message. It spoils the historic nature of the area.

Anyone would be outraged if a giant house overshadows their property and destroys their privacy, which is the reason most residents live in this area. This new monster house does not belong in our area.

This is my request to stop the two story house proposed at 1169 Sesame Drive. There is still time to have the house conform to the standard one story layout of the majority of the neighborhood.

Respectfully,

Lance Cushenberry and Joyce Hasebe

Sunnyvale, Ca 94087

Subject: City of Sunnyvale Public Notice for 1169 Sesame Drive, Sunnyvale

Date: Wed, 4 May 2016 13:49:43 -0700

From: Planning AP <planning@sunnyvale.ca.gov>
To: Planning AP <planning@sunnyvale.ca.gov>

CC: Caliva-Lepe, Noren ncaliva-lepe@ci.sunnyvale.ca.us

Interested party:

Following is a public notice from the City of Sunnyvale:



1



Noren Caliva-Lepe, Associate Planner Community Development Department

City of Sunnyvale Phone: (408) 730-7659

ncaliva-lepe@sunnyvale.ca.gov

The Department of Community Development is innovative in promoting sustainable development while enhancing the economy, community character and quality of life in Sunnyvale.

Save the environment. Please don't print this email unless you really need to.

--

City of Sunnyvale Community Development Department Planning Division Answer Point planning@sunnyvale.ca.gov 408-730-7440

Noren Caliva-Lepe

From: Charles Shoemaker

Sent:Saturday, May 07, 2016 6:32 PMTo:ncaliva-lepe@sunnyvale.ca.govSubject:Two story Ichler on Sesame

As an Ichler owner on Vanderbilt Dr with three two story home surrounding me I have seen good designs and not good designs from the neighbors vow into my yard and Windows. The home proposed on Sesame would fit into the bad design category from the neighbor standpoint. Balconies that over look back yards and bedroom windows and the shadow cast on the northern neighbor have a large impact on the local neighbors. Design is definitely not fitting with the neighborhood and redesign protecting the neighbors privacy and sun light should be factored into the new design Charles Shoemaker 670 Vanderbilt Drive.

Sent from my iPad

Noren Caliva-Lepe

From: Julia Filippova

Sent:Sunday, May 01, 2016 5:21 PMTo:ncaliva-lepe@sunnyvale.ca.govSubject:Project at 1169 Sesame Drive

To: Noren Caliva-Lepe Associate Planner

Dear Planning Commissioners of Sunnyvale,

My husband and I have been residents of Fairbrae neighborhood for over 30 years.

I am writing to you in regards to the proposed project at 1169 Sesame Drive. I understand that the project was approved, but appeal was filed with the Planning Commission. Unfortunately, I will not be able to attend the hearing in person, as I will be away on 5/16. I do, however, want to express my strong support for allowing the project to go forward.

We regularly walk on Sesame Drive. When we saw a notice board put up about the project, we went to talk to the owners. Mr. Eliashberg and Mrs. Govberg were very friendly and spent their time explaining their design.

I am thoroughly impressed with the design of their new house. It both combines the modernist aesthetics and fits into the surrounding neighborhood. I am glad that the owners are making a contribution to the architectural uniqueness of Fairbrae - enhancing both character and value of our neighborhood. I am excited to see houses like these built in the neighborhood.

On a side note, I looked at some of the letters submitted by the opponents of the project, as well as the appeals. I am saddened by the angry and intolerant tone in them, directed not only toward Mr. Eliashberg and Mrs. Govberg, but towards other neighbors, who desire to improve their homes, thus increasing home values. I am also irked by a suggestion that the city's Planning Department is being "too lenient" toward those who seek improvement. I would like to commend Sunnyvale's Planning Department for spending lots of time on studying the proposed project, driving through the neighborhood and investigating all aspects of the aftermath of this project before considering its approval.

I find a push to implement a single story overlay misguided. I believe this action will stifle progress and limit an upside appreciation of all Fairbrae homes. It will also limit the potential increase in property taxes that the city can collect in the future to fund much needed programs. Very disappointing.

I wish Mr. Eliashberg and Mrs. Govberg best of luck with their undertaking and trust that the Planning Commission will agree that this project can only benefit our neighborhood.

Respectfully,

Julia Filippova and Gene Manheim



Virus-free. www.avast.com

Noren Caliva-Lepe

From: Stephen Meier

Sent: Tuesday, March 22, 2016 12:50 PM

To: Noren Caliva-Lepe

Subject: Fwd: Comments regarding 1169 Sesame - APN 202-07-041

Dear Noren:

I would like to inquire if you received my comment regarding 1169 Sesame and if I can get an update as to the status of the application and steps in the review process.

I and a number of other neighbors are very concerned about this project.

Best regards,	
Steve Meier	
Forwarded message	
From: Stephen Meier	
Date: Mon, Feb 29, 2016 at 2:49 PM	

Subject: Comments regarding 1169 Sesame - APN 202-07-041

To: <ncaliva-lepe@sunnyvale.ca.gov>

Dear Noren:

I am writing to you in regard to public comments on project proposed at 1169 Sesame Dr. I am a resident of Fairbrae neighborhood and feel affected by this project, and any precedent it might set.

In review the posted photo this project presents numerous problems which make it unacceptable for the Fairbrae neighborhood.

1) Massing

The front mass facing street side is huge and is dominate form in comparison to all other homes on the street.

2) Design

The design of the building has nothing esthetically similar to Eichler or mid-century modern design.

3) Lot Use

This parcel has a very deep lot, uncharacteristic in the neighborhood. It should be possible to design and build an Eichler-like home with same square footage as this proposal but with much less massing to the street front.

It appears the plan puts the bulk of the mass to the front (street side) of the house, the preserving a large back yard for private use.

It would be much better and fairer to neighbors for a tradeoff between massing and lot use.

If a 2nd floor is required, the 2nd floor should start much further back from the street so it's massing to the front is mitigated.

4) Family needs versus Commercial Development (Buy and Flip, Profit \$)

Attachment 7 Page 41 of 43

This home was recently purchased and with this new proposal to build a spec. home does not look to be a family seeking to expand and meet family needs, it appears to be an obvious commercial development opportunity to build a spec. home and then resale for profit. It seems that the current owners purchased an Eichler with specific intent to tear down and build a non-Eichler home. This is not consistent with neighborhood preservation and should be actively discouraged. We do not want to set a precedent of Eichler tear-downs rebuilds and flipping to non-Eilcher homes in our neighborhood as it will change the nature and essence of the Fairbrae community.

Joseph Eichler was a visionary builder/architect and his creations are part of mid-century architectural history. We should embrace and preserve this wonderful heritage.

 $\underline{http://sunnyvale.ca.gov/Portals/0/Sunnyvale/CDD/Residential/Additions/EichlerDGADOPTEDlowresolution.pdf} \\ \underline{https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Joseph~EichlerDGADOPTEDlowresolution.pdf} \\ \underline{https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Jos$

Please register my objection to this project.

Best regards, Stephen Meier , Sunnyvale CA 94087

Noren Caliva-Lepe

From: Eric Kuhn

Sent: Sunday, March 20, 2016 11:43 AM

To: Noren Caliva-Lepe

Subject: Re: 1169 Sesame Dr - Status Update

Thanks Noren for being so responsive to our concerns. We met with the owners of 1169 and they allayed us of our privacy concerns. We still are concerned about the feel of our Eichler neighborhood, whatever that is worth. However, we also now better appreciate the owners' perspectives and rights regarding their property.

Sent from my iPhone

On Mar 17, 2016, at 4:24 PM, Noren Caliva-Lepe <ncaliva-lepe@sunnyvale.ca.gov> wrote:

Neighbors,

Thank you for your comment letters. I have shared your concerns with the property owner of 1169 Sesame Drive and we have met to discuss possible modifications to the design. The property owners plan to submit revised plans as soon as possible. I will sent you another email with a summary of the revisions, my decision on the project, and appeal options soon after.

Please let me know if you have any further questions.

Regards, Noren

Noren Caliva-Lepe, Associate Planner Community Development Department City of Sunnyvale

Phone: (408) 730-7659

ncaliva-lepe@sunnyvale.ca.gov

The Department of Community Development is innovative in promoting sustainable development while enhancing the economy, community character and quality of life in Sunnyvale.

Save the environment. Please don't print this email unless you really need to.

Sunnyvale Planning Commission Ref: We Oppose the second-story addition at 1169 Sesame Dr. File# 2016-7031

Dear Commission Members:

My name is Roger Teter, and I am a concerned neighbor, living at 682 Tiffany Court. We bought our Eichler home in 1968 for its beauty and privacy. We have greatly enjoyed living at this location in the Fairbrae tract of Eichler homes, with their floor-to-ceiling glass windows providing indoor/outdoor living throughout the year.

In 1978 we added 505 square feet of living space to our single-story Eichler home by building outward at the rear of our house. Our single story addition matched and maintained all of the original Eichler design features and does not intrude on the privacy of neighbors.

We oppose, however, the planned addition at 1169 Sesame Drive because the proposed two-story non-Eichler design would result in an invasion of privacy for neighboring single-story homes.

The proposed roof-top additional living space at 1169 Sesame Drive, which the architect may be calling a "deck", is, in fact, a privacy-invading BALCONY. These large second story additions should not be allowed in the single-story Fairbrae Eichler tract.

There was no prior notice given to the Fairbrae tract homeowners of the proposed second-story addition at 1169 Sesame Drive, even though it will invade the privacy of neighboring Eichler homes. Its very design threatens to destroy the beauty and privacy of indoor-outdoor living that is a hallmark of all Eichler homes in the entire Fairbrae tract.

Therefore, we strenuously oppose and object to this addition of a large second story on an Eichler home. We urge the Committee to reject this proposal and prevent this second story at 1169 Sesame Drive from being built.

Sincerely Roger Teter