

Equipment Analysis Summary – Primary Treatment Facility Project					
Element	Justification	(1) % of Primary Treatment Facility Construction Cost	(2) % of Full Program Automation Build Out	Downside - Not Selecting	Procurement Options
Eutek HeadCell Grit Vortex System	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Most cost-effective grit removal alternative based on net present value analysisBased on field testing at the WPCP, provides the best performance for removal of grit (based on characteristics of grit entering the facility)Unique equipment design	\$558K (0.6%)	NA	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Finer materials may cause premature wear on downstream equipment and increase maintenanceGrit accumulation in the digesters and loss of solids treatment capacity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Negotiate and pre-purchase (supply to installation contractor)Negotiate and assign to installation contractor as part of bidding process
COANDA Fine Grit Washer	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Produces cleaner, drier & less odorous final product for disposalReduced costs for disposal and odor controlUnique equipment design	\$525K (0.5%)	NA	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Higher cost for grit hauling and disposalLarger Odor Control Facility (i.e., capital cost)Higher ventilation rates for odor control (i.e., O&M cost)Loss of a significant portion of captured grit, back to the process stream.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Negotiate and pre-purchase (supply to installation contractor)Negotiate and assign to installation contractor as part of bidding process
Huber SuperLaunder Screenings Washer Compactor	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Produces cleaner, drier, and less odorous final product for disposalReduced costs for disposal and odor controlUnique equipment designReduces potential for exposure of plant staff and outside haulers to fecal matter in screenings off-haul material	\$350K (0.4%)	NA	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Higher cost for screenings hauling and disposalLarger Odor Control Facility (i.e., capital cost)Higher ventilation rates for odor control (i.e., O&M cost)Increases potential for exposure of plant staff and outside haulers to fecal matter in screening off-haul material	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Negotiate and pre-purchase (supply to installation contractor)Negotiate and assign to installation contractor as part of bidding process
Rockwell (Allen-Bradley) Programmable Logic Controller (PLC)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Largest US market shareBest local factory and integration support presenceLowest initial capital and lowest ongoing operational costOpen architecture/ease of programming	\$200K (0.2%)	\$800K (5.4%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Use of Incompatible PLCs would result in higher costs of programming	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Allow competition amongst various suppliers to dictate price through low bid processConduct competitive bid or proposal process to pre-purchase equipment to supply to installation contractorConduct bid or proposal process to pre-select equipment supplier and assign to installation contractor as part of bidding process
Rockwell (Allen-Bradley) Intellicenter Motor Control Center and free standing Reduced Voltage Solid State (RVSS) and VFDs	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Largest US market shareSupports EtherNET/IP Device Level Ring (DLR) communication at each overload and motor drivers (VFDs & RVSS) which reduces cabinet complexity and minimizes future maintenanceLowest programming costs based on prewritten code for the Rockwell PLCsReduces number of Ethernet switches in the project and reduces maintenance and configuration time to set up the switches.	\$500K (0.5%)	NA	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Reduces complexity of cabinet, minimizes future maintenance and reduces cost of programming	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Allow competition amongst various suppliers to dictate price through low bid processConduct competitive bid or proposal process to pre-purchase equipment to supply to installation contractorConduct bid or proposal process to pre-select equipment supplier and assign to installation contractor as part of bidding process
Rockwell (Allen-Bradley) FactoryTalk HMI Software and Associated Hardware	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Easiest integration with Rockwell PLCs.Reduces costs associated with future integration of new PLCs and other software devices.Lower initial capital and lower ongoing operational cost than other object-oriented programming packagesOffers large diversity of associated software programs from single developer	\$450K (0.5%) Software and Associated Hardware	\$450K (3.1%)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">More difficult integration with PLCsHigher integration costHigher on-going operational costsAssociated third party software programs may also need to be sole sourced	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Allow competition amongst various suppliers to dictate price through low bid processConduct competitive bid or proposal process to pre-purchase equipment to supply to installation contractorConduct bid or proposal process to pre-select equipment supplier and assign to installation contractor as part of bidding process
(1) Estimated construction value of Primary Treatment Facility project \$98 million (2) Estimated value of full Automation and Control System Program build out \$14.7 Million					