

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

- 1A**      [16-0152](#)      Approval of the Draft Minutes of December 9, 2015 Parks and Recreation Commission

Commissioner Alexander III moved and Vice Chair Kenton seconded the motion to approve the minutes of December 9, 2015. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 3 - Chair Pasqua  
Vice Chair Kenton  
Commissioner Alexander III

**No:** 0

**Abstain:** 1 - Commissioner Pochowski

**PUBLIC HEARINGS/GENERAL BUSINESS**

- 2**      [16-0024](#)      Recommendation on the Relocation of the Butcher House and Update on the Design of the Orchard Heritage Park Improvement Project (Study Issue)

Assistant Director of Public Works and City Engineer Craig Mobeck provided the staff report. Commissioner's questions were answered including: 1) how the Butcher House will be used by the Historical Society; 2) the definition of CEQA; 3) the number of trees that would be removed in each of the Alternatives; and 4) who would pay for the retaining wall in each Alternative.

Chair Pasqua opened the item for public comment.

Charlie Olson spoke about the orchard's history and his support for Alternative 2.

Laura Babcock, Director of the Sunnyvale Heritage Park Museum, spoke in support of Alternative 1 which she indicates is the only Alternative that will allow the Historical Society to operate the Butcher House effectively as an annex to the museum. She explained that the Society has the ability to raise funds to move the house. She answered Commissioner's questions related to the museum operations.

Leslie Lawton, President of the Sunnyvale Historical Society, spoke in support of Alternative 1 to preserve the 1912 Butcher House as a Sunnyvale working farm house. She stated the Society doesn't have the docent staff to support the Butcher House in any other location than proposed in Alternative 1.

Zachary Kaufman spoke in support of Alternative 3. He stated he had supported Alternative 2 as a reasonable compromise and changed to Alternative 3 because the Historical Society is opposed to Alternative 2. He prefers to not move the Butcher House and supports preserving the history of agriculture in this valley.

Michael Geribaldi spoke in support of Alternative 3 and felt removing one tree was too many. He stated if the City determined the house to be historical then the developers would be required to build it into their design.

Mary Egan spoke in support of protecting the trees in the Heritage Orchard.

Karen Ireland spoke in support of protecting the trees in the Heritage Orchard. She stated that she doesn't understand why the museum needs more docents if Alternative 2 was selected over Alternative 1.

Vladimir Preysman lives near the Butcher House and stated he was not aware of it and doesn't see its significance. He spoke in support of saving the orchards because the orchard and the fruit are what his children remember from growing up in this valley.

Ken Cook spoke against moving the maintenance facilities along Michelangelo Drive because it will obstruct the view from the street and take away land from the current park area. He stated he has concerns about the Historical Society's ability to fund the project. He supports Alternative 4 and suggested to redesign the shed so that it is more aesthetically pleasing without moving it.

Irene Preysman spoke in opposition of removing any trees.

Martin Landzant spoke in support of Alternative 3. He stated the Historic Preservation Commission should be involved in this review process and that the museum has already received significant benefit from the City. He expressed concern that additional historic houses could be moved to the orchard.

Steve Scandalis spoke in support of preserving the orchard. He attended the community meetings which discussed finding the best location for the Butcher House. He stated the jewel of the park is the operating orchard and considers the museum to be secondary. He suggested the Butcher House could be preserved at another location if needed.

Nan Mehan spoke in support of Alternative 2 or 3 and is opposed to removing any

trees. She stated the cost to put the house in the back of the property (Alternative 1) is much more expensive than Alternative 2.

Janet Hamma spoke in support of Alternative 2. She stated she has toured the Butcher House and her assessment is that it is not especially large or distinctive and it needs a lot of work. She stated the last remaining orchard has more significance and value than the Butcher House. She suggested if we want to commemorate the Butchers, we could name a street or park for them.

Joe Shane spoke against moving the Butcher House and supports Alternative 2 if the house is moved. He is opposed to removing any trees.

There were no further comments and Chair Pasqua closed the Public Hearing.

Vice Chair Kenton inquired if the Historical Society would consider modifying the size of the Butcher House to make it fit without removing trees. Chair Pasqua asked about the footprint size of the museum and the Butcher House.

Commissioner Alexander III moved, and Commissioner Pochowski seconded, the motion to approve Alternative 2 - Direct staff to move forward with CEQA evaluation of the proposal to relocate the Butcher House to the lawn area and acknowledge that a future budget modification with the construction contract award will be required to provide funding for drainage improvements (re-grading and valley gutter) behind the existing multi-purpose building. The costs of CEQA compliance will be borne by the Historical Society.

Commissioners discussed the ramifications of the Historical Society's position to support only Alternative 1, and the possibility of Council working with the Historical Society to accept Alternative 2. They discussed whether the City is interested in saving the Butcher House and the possibility of naming it as a historical landmark. Vice Chair Kenton and Chair Pasqua disclosed that they visited and toured the museum prior to the Commission meeting. They discussed the cost of moving the house; how long it will take the Historical Society to raise the funds; and if it might cause delays to the builder at Butcher's Corner. Commissioners discussed the need for the retaining wall and related costs.

Commissioner Pochowski proposed a friendly amendment to advise Council that the Commission strongly feels Alternative 2 is the best location, and to direct staff to make Alternative 2 work for the Historical Society. If unable to come to an agreement then accept Alternative 1 due to the orchard and the historical significance of the structure. Commissioner Alexander III declined the friendly

amendment.

The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 2 - Commissioner Alexander III  
Commissioner Pochowski

**No:** 1 - Chair Pasqua

**Abstain:** 1 - Vice Chair Kenton

Commissioners provided the rationale for their vote. Commissioner Alexander III stated he didn't see public support to move the Butcher House. While he supports the Heritage Society, he believes there is a possibility of permanently losing more trees than estimated. Commissioner Pochowski supports preserving the orchard and the architecture. He stated his opinion that Alternative 2 is the proper location to move the Butcher House, and he stated that he hopes Council can work with the related parties to find a solution. Chair Pasqua stated he has faith that the Historical Society can raise the funds, and while he understands the concern for the trees, he supported Alternative 1 because he understands how the Butcher House is part of our history and we are slowly losing that history. Vice Chair Kenton abstained because he is uncertain of the best solution as he supports saving the trees and also can appreciate saving the house.

Chair Pasqua agreed to represent the Commission at the Council meeting on March 15.

A question regarding the outcome of the vote was raised and Chair Pasqua called a recess to allow staff to verify the result of the vote.

Following the recess, Chair Pasqua reconvened the meeting with all Commissioners present and the Commission considered agenda item 3. Following action on agenda item 3, staff confirmed the vote on agenda item 2 passed.

**3**      [15-1095](#)      Agreement Renewal with Sustainable Community Gardens for Property Located at 433 Charles Street

Superintendent of Parks and Golf Jim Stark presented the staff report. He answered Commissioner's questions related to the term of the agreement.

Chair Pasqua opened the public hearing.

Eric Fulda, the Community Garden Coordinator, thanked the City for the privilege to