



LIVE OAK ASSOCIATES, INC.

an Ecological Consulting Firm

March 4, 2021

Josh Rupert
STC Venture 200 WA, LLC
10121 Miller Ave., Suite 200
Cupertino, CA 95014

**RE: Review of the Block 3 North project's conformance with the City of Sunnyvale's Bird Safe Building Design Guidelines, in the City of Sunnyvale, Santa Clara County, California.
(PN 2551-01)**

Dear Mr. Rupert:

Per your request, Live Oak Associates, Inc. (LOA) has conducted a review of a proposed STC Venture 200 WA, LLC project called Block 3 North (alternately Cityline Sunnyvale Buildings 3A & 3B Project) located in the City of Sunnyvale, California. The purpose of the review was to understand and document whether the proposed project conforms with the City's Bird Safe Building Design Guidelines (adopted on January 28, 2014). To accomplish this work, LOA reviewed project plans, studied the setting of the site via aerial imagery, and interviewed project engineers regarding building design. The following report documents our findings.

Project Setting.

The Block 3 North project is in downtown Sunnyvale in the approximate location of a closed Macy's department store located at W. Washington Avenue, S. Murphy Avenue, and S. Taaffe Street adjacent to the City's approximately 2.4-acre Redwood Park. The surrounding land uses are primarily commercial and multi-unit residential buildings, roadways, and parking. The Redwood Park occurs to the south of the project site, and it is slated for redevelopment with multi-story buildings to be built concurrently with the Block 3 North project. There are no bodies of water larger than 1 acre in extent within more than 1 mile from the project site, and there is very little open space in the vicinity of the site. Open space occurring within 0.5-mile radius of the project includes Redwood Park immediately adjacent to the site and Washington Park approximately 0.35 miles to the west.

The proposed project includes bisecting the property with a new road and redeveloping a site with an existing building into two 125-foot tall, 7 level buildings.

Bird Safe Building Design Guidelines.

The City of Sunnyvale maintains bird safe building design guidelines to inform CEQA review for new development. The guidelines are designed to reduce the impact of buildings, specifically

Oakhurst: P.O. Box 2697 • 39930 Sierra Way, Suite B • Oakhurst, CA 93644 • Phone: (559) 642-4880 • Fax: (559) 642-4883
San Jose: 6840 Via Del Oro, Suite 220 • San Jose, CA 95119 • Phone: (408) 224-8300 • Fax: (408) 224-1411
Truckee: P.O. Box 8810 • Truckee, CA 96161 • Phone: (530) 214-8947

windows, on native birds that are known to collide with windowpanes often resulting in death to the individual bird. Known as the Bird Safe Building Design Guidelines (“Guidelines”)—adopted by the City on January 28, 2014—the Guidelines provide specific design direction for buildings. The Guidelines are separated into two categories: Guidelines for buildings within 300 feet of open space or water bodies that are 1-acre or larger, and guidelines for other buildings. The existing condition of the project site is identified as a project located within 300 feet of open space, Redwood Park, that is larger than 1-acre in extent; however, it is our understanding that this project will be built concurrently with another project within the park’s footprint and that the City understands that the subject project will not occur adjacent to open space. Therefore, LOA has reviewed the project’s level of conformance with guidelines for buildings that are not near open space or water bodies (Table 1).

Table 1. Sunnyvale Bird Safe Building Design Guidelines for Buildings Not Located Near Open Space, Block 3 North design elements, and conformance level		
<i>Guidelines for buildings not within 300 feet of open space or water bodies</i>	<i>Block 3 North Project Design Elements</i>	<i>Conformance</i>
<i>Avoid large expanse of glass near open areas, especially when tall landscaping is immediately adjacent to the glass walls</i>	The proposed buildings will be in a highly urbanized portion of the City that will eventually lack open space. Currently a small park—Redwood Park—occurs to the south of the proposed project. This park will be redeveloped into multi-story buildings concurrently with the Block 3 North project. Therefore, all glass elements of the building exterior are not adjacent to open areas. Further, the applicant has reported that the glass panels have been minimized, breaking up the glass panels with concrete and terra cotta cladding.	In conformance. This assumes the concurrent development of Redwood Park.
<i>Avoid the funneling of open space towards a building face</i>	Open space will not be funneled toward the building. Building is in a densely developed urban center of Sunnyvale.	In conformance.
<i>Prohibit glass skyways or freestanding glass walls</i>	Building design will use no skywalks or freestanding glass walls.	In conformance.
<i>Avoid transparent glass walls coming together at building corners to avoid birds trying to fly through glass</i>	Transparent glass corners are limited, mostly present in upper levels of the buildings. Applicant reports that such glass corners have been minimized in design. There are no glass corners in the lower level. Also, such glass paneling is visually broken up by solid panels of concrete cladding and terra cotta.	Partially in conformance.

<i>Reduce glass at top of building, especially when incorporating a green roof into the design;</i>	No green roof is proposed. The top of the building contains a mechanical penthouse that will not have glass panels. The next floors down have low-reflectivity glass broken up with terra cotta paneling.	In conformance
<i>Prohibit up lighting or spotlights;</i>	Light fixtures at the lower level are located under the storefront canopies or within the trellis-like structure around the building to shine down onto the sidewalk. Lighting for Washington Avenue, Taaffe Avenue, and Murphy Street are City standard pole lights which are shielded on the top. Lighting along Francis Street are pole mounted downlights. No spotlights or up-lighting is proposed.	In conformance
<i>Shield lighting to cast light down onto the area to be illuminated;</i>		In conformance
<i>Turn commercial building lights off at night or incorporate blinds into window treatment to use when lights are on at night;</i>	The project is proposed as a shell and core structure; therefore, the interior design is subject to future tenancy. Interior windows are provisioned for interior blinds if the future tenant chooses.	N/A
<i>Create smaller zones in internal lighting layouts to discourage wholesale area illumination;</i>	The project is proposed as a shell and core structure; therefore, the interior design is subject to future tenancy.	N/A

Block 3 North Project Bird Safe Design Conformance.

In general, the Block 3 North project appears to have adopted elements of the Bird Safe Building Design Guidelines as part of project planning. The proposed project is considered in conformance with the guidelines for buildings that are not within 300 feet of open space or water bodies. Building windows are all entirely low-reflectivity glass with very low reflectivity (10%) on the lowest floor. Windows are not contiguous across floors or generally contiguous from floor to floor, as they are broken up with alternate opaque materials (i.e., cement cladding and terra cotta). All exterior lighting appears to be in conformance with the building design guidance. There are no windows on the top floor of the building.

While the Guideline of having transparent glass walls joining or nearly joining at corners is mostly met, some corners of the building could potentially have visibility for birds through the building windows, depending on how interior design elements are incorporated. (As mentioned elsewhere, interior design is not part of this project). If birds can see from one side of the building through another side of the building, such as at windowed corners, studies indicate that this creates a potential increased risk for collision as birds may recognize the transparent windows as a passageway. Such windowed corners, however, are only apparently the case for a limited number of the building corners at certain floors and are mostly avoided altogether. Therefore, LOA has determined that this element is partially met. It is also assumed that the opaque material paneling near such windows will increase building visibility of some birds. Therefore, LOA has concluded that this Guideline is partially fulfilled. To increase the bird safety of corner windows or any windows beyond the present

design, and beyond the Guidelines, the project could include acid etched patterning (e.g., a 2-inch by 4-inch pattern of 6 mm dotted lines) to the exterior of the glass. Such a pattern is available in multiple products that are nearly invisible to humans but visible to birds.

As noted in Table 1, several of the Guidelines pertain to interior design elements (e.g., interior lighting, use of blinds, even the room design near windowed corners, etc.). For these, they are dependent on future tenant improvements, which are not included in the project. Therefore, LOA recommends that interior-specific Guidelines be addressed as part of the Tenant Improvement permit stage of the project.

Conclusion.

LOA concludes that the proposed Block 3 North project is in conformance with the City's Guidelines. Interior design elements of the building are not subject to the proposed project; therefore, Guidelines relevant to the interior design should be reviewed as part of the Tenant Improvement permit stage of the project.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Nathan Hale', is positioned above the printed name.

Nathan Hale, M.S.
Project Manager
Staff Biologist