



# City of Sunnyvale

## Meeting Minutes - Final Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Commission

---

Thursday, March 21, 2024

6:30 PM

Online and Bay Conference Room, City  
Hall, 456 W. Olive Ave.,  
Sunnyvale, CA 94086

---

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Oey called the meeting to order at 6:32 p.m.

### **SALUTE TO THE FLAG**

Chair Oey led the salute to the flag.

### **ROLL CALL**

**Present 6 -** Chair Timothy Oey  
Commissioner Alex Bonne  
Commissioner Arwen Davé  
Commissioner Dan Hafeman  
Commissioner Sharlene Liu  
Commissioner Leia Mehlman  
**Absent 1 -** Vice Chair Bryce Beagle

Vice Chair Beagle (unexcused absence)

Council Liaison Sell (present)

### **PRESENTATION**

**A**      [24-0503](#)      Sunnyvale Safe Routes to School Coordinator Updates 2023

Due to unforeseen circumstances item #24-0503 - Sunnyvale Safe Routes to School Coordinator Updates 2023 will need to be rescheduled to a different date.

**B**      [24-0504](#)      Climate Action Playbook Update 2023

Christina Raby, Environmental Engineering Coordinator with ESD, and Madeline Khair, Environmental Programs Manager, gave a presentation on the Climate Action Playbook Progress Updates and 2022 Greenhouse Gas Inventory. Highlighting the following:

- Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) metrics have been raised back to the previous levels due to feedback from outreach
- Total Emissions by Year
- 2022 Emissions by Sector
- Emissions from 2008-2022 by Sector
- Key Drivers in 2022 Emissions Increase
- Transportation Emission Trends
- 2022 Climate Action Playbook (CAP) Metric #8 - Percent Zero-Emission Vehicles in Sunnyvale
- Electricity Sector Emission Trends
- 2022 CAP Metric #1 - Percent of Electricity from Carbon Free Sources
- Off-Road Emissions - Change to Methodology
- Off-Road Sector Emissions - Change Between Methodologies
- CAP Metric #11 - Net number of New Trees Planted
- CAP Progress Updates - FY 23/24 Progress Update - Key Accomplishments

Commissioner Liu asked about the following:

- How do you measure VMT?
- Was the VMT target for 2045 reset back to 25% reduction?
- Were there any highlights from the Study Session?
- Why did electricity emissions increase from 2021 to 2022 in both residential and commercial buildings?
- Would it be useful to track the number of vehicles per driving adults in the City to track carbon and transportation?
- Has the City of Sunnyvale considered having volunteers plant trees?
- Has there only been 58 heat pump water heaters installed?
- How much staff time does it take and how much money does it take on a yearly basis to implement the Climate Action Playbook?
- Is it a Citywide effort to implement the Climate Action Playbook?

Ms. Tsang, Ms. Khair and Ms. Raby addressed the questions.

Commissioner Davé asked about the following:

- Did the footnote on the tree planting slide apply to all the years?

Ms. Raby addressed the question.

Commissioner Mehlman asked about the following:

- Slide 6 - What is the reason for not seeing a reduction for the commercial industrial gas emissions?
- What reduction strategies does the City have for existing commercial infrastructure?
- Does the rationale of new versus existing construction explain the residential gas flat line?
- What strategies is the City employing to get people out of their single occupancy vehicles and onto alternative modes of transportation?
- What is the overall increase in electric vehicle charging stations throughout the City?
- By what means is the City using to generate electricity?

Ms. Khair addressed the questions.

Commissioner Bonne asked about the following:

- Which sub category in the off-road vehicles category is the largest contributor? Is it two cycle engines?
- What are the top three strategies for reducing VMT?

Ms. Raby and Ms. Khair addressed the questions.

Commissioner Hafeman asked about the following:

- Are residents who pay for renewable electricity paying more?
- How do you measure the total amount of fuel that's going into an off road sector?
- Are there any calculations being done on per capita representation on how the City is doing?
- Have you considered surveying major employers?

Ms. Khair and Ms. Raby addressed the question.

Chair Oey asked about the following:

- Has there been any effort in measuring VMT more directly? Such as StreetLight data and working with Google?
- Slide 9 - How do you track bicycles in Sunnyvale?
- Slide 10 - How much is the City using of Green Start versus Green Prime?
- Where are the four off grid EV Chargers located?
- Slide 17 - Is there an overall metric of total number of water heaters in Sunnyvale?
- Are there any bicycle encouragement programs in the City?
- Have you considered promoting VTA's educational series?

- Any considerations for Bike to Work Day or Bike to Wherever Day as part of the Climate Action Plan?

Ms. Tsang and Ms. Khair addressed the questions.

Commissioner Mehlman asked about the following:

- What is the source of the carbon contamination of the geothermal plan?

Ms. Khair addressed the question.

Commissioner Liu asked about the following:

- Would StreetLight data be accurate in tracking reduction of VMT?
- Will the City use sensors to count the number of bikes along certain corridors?
- Would it make sense to have more detail on the CAP Scorecard?

Ms. Tsang and Ms. Khair addressed the questions.

Commissioner Mehlman asked about the following:

- Can the transportation column be broken down into public transit versus private transit in terms of carbon emissions?

Ms. Khair addressed the question.

Public Comment opened at 7:52 p.m.

Bryce Beagle, member of the public, commented and asked about the following:

- Almost 50% of the emissions are from transportation
- Electric vehicle adoption will not save us
- How has the City's population growth aligned with predictions in the model?
- Is the population growing faster than expected or slower?
- Can per capita data be presented at one of the presentations?

Public Comment closed at 7:55 p.m.

Chair Oey commented on the following:

- Would like a "Love to Ride Program" in the City of Sunnyvale - tracks and encourages bicycle mode share and tracks pedestrians/bicyclists

Commissioner Hafeman asked about the following:

- Is the City of Sunnyvale actively working with VTA to find out what Sunnyvale can do to make public transit work better?

Ms. Tsang addressed the question.

Council Liaison Sell commented on the following:

- Thanked the commission for their great questions
- Appreciated the commission for their concern for the climate and how important the commission is for active transportation
- Thanked the Transportation staff and ESD staff for all their hard work

### **ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

Public Comment opened at 8:00 p.m.

No speakers.

Public Comment closed at 8:01 p.m.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

Public Comment opened at 8:01 p.m.

No speakers.

Public Comment closed at 8:02 p.m.

- 1.A**      [24-0502](#)      Approve the Bicycle and Pedestrian Commission Meeting Minutes of February 15, 2024.

Approve the Bicycle and Pedestrian Commission Meeting Minutes of February 15, 2024 as submitted.

Commissioner Hafeman moved and Commissioner Mehlman seconded to approve amended item 1.A.

The amendment was made by Commissioner Hafeman who stated that on Page 17 under Ms. Tsang's comments that there is a typo in three sentences. The word "Visibility" should be replaced with Feasibility in the following sentences:

1. Evaluate "Visibility" should be "Feasibility" of an Art Crosswalk Program was deferred
2. Evaluate "Visibility" should be "Feasibility" of Dog Leash Hours in select Sunnyvale Parks
3. Explore the "Visibility" should be "Feasibility" of converting the PG&E Lots facing Ramona Avenue, Lois Avenue and Donna Avenue into an open green space

Commissioner Liu commented that she will not approve the minutes because they are one sided.

Commissioner Hafeman commented he liked the minutes with staff's answers to the questions.

The amendment carried with the following vote:

**Yes 4 -** Chair Oey  
Commissioner Bonne  
Commissioner Hafeman  
Commissioner Mehlman

**No 1 -** Commissioner Liu

**Absent 1 -** Vice Chair Beagle

**Abstain 1 -** Commissioner Davé

**1.B**      [24-0507](#)      Approve the Joint Study Session Meeting Minutes of November 30, 2023.

Approve the Joint Study Session Meeting Minutes of November 30, 2023 as submitted.

Chair Oey motioned and Commissioner Bonne seconded to approve amended item 1.B.

The amendment was made by Chair Oey who stated that on page 29 at the top where BPAC Chair Oey commented "requested staff invest in real data to track VMT's in Sunnyvale and suggested using methods such as "stop light data" should be "StreetLight Data" to track transportation instead of using estimates in the current methodology.

Commissioner Hafemen stated he has a hard time voting to approve the minutes since it was a very long meeting and doesn't remember what happened in it and it was many months ago.

The amendment carried with the following vote:

**Yes 4 -** Chair Oey  
Commissioner Bonne  
Commissioner Liu  
Commissioner Mehlman

**No 0**

**Absent 1 -** Vice Chair Beagle

**Abstain 2 -** Commissioner Davé  
Commissioner Hafeman

## **PUBLIC HEARINGS/GENERAL BUSINESS**

### **2      [24-0505](#)      Discussion on Projects for Transportation Development Act (TDA) Article 3 Application**

Angela Wong, Transportation Engineer, gave a presentation on the Discussion for Transportation Development Act, also known as TDA Article 3, funding for Fiscal Year 2024/2025. Highlighting the following:

- TDA funding can be used for the following:
  - Design & construction of a bicycle/pedestrian capital or quick build project
  - Secured bicycle parking facilities in high use activity areas
  - Restriping Class II bicycle lanes
- City receives about \$140,000/year - based on sales tax
- Last year City Council made an action to file the application of the FY 2023/24 TDA Article 3 funding for the Design phase of the Installation of Sidewalk on Poplar Avenue (\$160,000)
- Bank the remaining funds (\$176,620) for construction
- February 6, 2024 - Council reaffirmed the action to reserve future TDA allocations for construction
- Currently there is \$411,038 funds left for FY 2024/25
- Staff provides evaluation of proposed projects and provides staff recommendation
- BPAC Commissioners discuss proposed projects
- No motion needed at this time - BPAC to make a recommendation for a project during the May BPAC Meeting
- Project #1 - Install sidewalk on Poplar Avenue near Peterson Middle School
- Project #2 - Convert part-time bike lanes on Homestead Road between Wright and New Brunswick Avenues into full-time bike lanes
- Project #3 - Convert all part-time bike lanes on Homestead Road into full-time bike lanes
- Project #4 - Reduce pork chop islands on Westbound El Camino Real at Murphy Avenue and at Frances Street
- Project #5 - Implement Class III Bicycle Route on Pastoria Avenue
- Project #6 - Widen fence opening at Crawford Drive near Las Palmas Park

- Project #7 - Improvements to Bike/Pedestrian Bridges and Paths at The Dalles Bridge at SR85
- Project #7 - Improvements to Bike/Pedestrian Bridges and Paths at Borregas Bridge/US101 and SR 237
- Project #7 - Improvements to Bike/Pedestrian Bridges and Paths at Cheyenne Drive between Valcartier Drive and Yukon Drive
- Project #7 - Improvements to Bike/Pedestrian Bridges and Paths at Stella Court to Las Palmas Park
- Project #7 - Improvements to Bike/Pedestrian Bridges and Paths at Fremont Avenue/Belleville Way
- Project #8 - Provide continuous bike lane going east/westbound at Fremont Avenue/Belleville Way
- Project #9 - Install Pedestrian Scramble and Bike Boxes at Kennewick Drive and Homestead Road
- Project #10 - Turn Prohibition at the City Parking Lot on Evelyn Avenue east of Francis Street
- Project #11 - Implement Red Curb pertaining to AB 413

Commissioner Mehlman asked about the following:

- What is the difference between "No Stopping" and "No Parking" in terms of signage?
- Why is "No Parking" selected in Project #2 as opposed to "No Stopping"?
- Project #10 - How was it determined that an illegal left turn was not hazardous to cyclists/pedestrians?

Ms. Tsang addressed the questions.

Commissioner Hafeman commented and asked about the following:

- Why is the BPAC Commission discussing TDA funding when City Council decided to bank the funds?
- In favor of having \$30,000 to add to "No Parking Signs"
- What is remaining as part-time bike lanes on Homestead Road?

Ms. Tsang and Ms. Wong addressed the question.

Commissioner Liu commented and asked about the following:

- Project #10 - Illegal left turn creates a safety issue for cyclists
- All of the projects that have requested bollards to be removed are safety issue for bikes. Why does staff not think they are a safety issue?



Ms. Wong addressed the question.

Commissioner Davé asked about the following:

- How should a cyclist use and approach the bollards at the end of the bike exit from the Borregas overpass?

Ms. Tsang addressed the question.

Chair Oey asked about the following:

- Why does the bollard at the end of the bike exit from the Borregas overpass say "Stop"?
- Why aren't bollards put in at stop signs for cars to slow them down?
- Slide 20 - Why isn't it eligible for TDA funding if two bike lanes are put in to connect?

Ms. Tsang addressed the questions.

Commissioner Liu asked about the following:

- Project #7 - The Dalles Bridge at SR85 - How was it decided that this was pedestrian use only? For Safe Routes to School purposes this should not have been made for pedestrian only.

Ms. Tsang addressed the question.

Commissioner Hafeman commented on the following:

- Project #7 - The Dalles Bridge at SR85 has very sharp turns so need to walk your bike

Public Comment opened at 8:49 p.m.

No speakers.

Public Comment closed at 8:50 p.m.

Commissioner Mehlman commented on the following:

- Moot point to be discussing the TDA funding since City Council decided to bank the funds
- Bollards are a safety hazard to cyclists
- Signs and paint do not save lives
- Project #7 - Fremont Avenue/Belleville Way - Bollards are placed there to deter

speeding because sidewalk ends and there is no place for pedestrians to go. Not sure whose speeding your trying to deter since it is on a level road. It is a hazard for cyclists

- Removing bollards makes sense
- Speed bumps are great to slow cyclists down
- Designing physical infrastructure to prevent drivers from endangering cyclists and pedestrians is the best way to about it
- Extend the bollards down Evelyn Avenue

Commissioner Liu commented on the following:

- Not in favor of banking funds because costs of implementation, especially construction is skyrocketing over the last few years
- Bank funds are worth less as time goes by
- In favor of putting the funds toward the design of the Homestead Bike Lanes
- Project #5 - Recommends dropping the project because there are Class III bike boulevard bike routes on Pastoria Avenue and Pastoria Avenue vehicular car traffic is busy enough that it wouldn't help to put in sharrows
- Recommends taking out the bollard at the Dalles Bridge at SR85 to prevent crashes
- Agrees with other commissioners that the bollards at Borregas Avenue over 101 overpass and 237 should be removed for safety reasons
- Project #9 - Install Pedestrian Scramble and Bike Boxes at Kennewick Drive and Homestead Road - This should be considered for TDA funding outside of doing a study issue for it
- Project #10 - Turn Prohibition at the City Parking Lot on Evelyn Avenue east of Francis Street - This should be a separate issue from the budget proposal process and considered for TDA funding

Commissioner Davé commented on the following:

- Recommended staff to focus on getting TDA funding for the Full-time bike lanes on Homestead Road, Kennewick Drive and Homestead Road pedestrian scramble and Evelyn crossing by Caltrain Station because they are all very dangerous areas
- When installing bollards give enough space before them to stop and hindered by narrow walls

Commissioner Hafeman commented on the following:

- TDA funding should not be banked
- More effort should be put into a grant proposal to fund the Poplar Avenue Sidewalk Installation near Peterson Middle School

- Would like to see the TDA funding used for the design of the Homestead Full-Time Bike Lanes
- Suggest implementing the sidewalks on Poplar Avenue near Peterson Middle School if there is enough funds

Commissioner Bonne commented on the following:

- If obstacles are used in a shared path for bikes/pedestrians then the same logic should be used for shared paths for vehicles/bikes by putting up some kind of barrier

Chair Oey commented on the following:

- TDA funds should not be used to pursue the Peterson Sidewalk Program
- TDA funds should be used for smaller opportunistic projects
- Bollards are well known hazards to bicyclists
- Bollards should only be used when there's car ingress possibility
- Happy to see that there are other funds for curb paintings
- In favor of getting the Homestead Bike Lanes done without TDA funding
- Appreciates staff who is continuing to maintain some of the projects and rolling them forward

Commissioner Liu asked about the following:

- Will staff changed their recommendations after hearing the BPAC's comments?

Ms. Tsang addressed the question.

Council member Sell asked about the following:

- Could bollards be a study issue?
- Is there a policy that states when to bank TDA funds?
- What are the options for commissioners proposing a budget proposal item?

Ms. Tsang and Chair Oey addressed the questions.

**3**      [24-0506](#)      Report and Discussion of Recent Santa Clara Valley  
Transportation Authority (VTA) Bicycle and Pedestrian  
Advisory Committee (BPAC) Meeting

Commissioner Bonne, VTA BPAC Sunnyvale Representative, gave the meetings summary report March 2024 regarding the following topics:

- Chairman reported two cyclists were killed in North County in January with one

being on Foothill Expressway

- Chairman witnessed collision between right-turning car and student-ridden bicycle in bike lane on Homestead Road near Homestead High School
- Equitable Vehicle Miles Travelled Program by Robert Swierk included:
  - Public outreach via pop-up tables, web surveys, 4-language brochures, website explainer videos
- Top priority of public feedback is:
  - Reduce cost of public transport
  - Time vs driving
  - Fast & frequent service
  - More biking and walking paths
  - Proximity of public transport destinations to "interesting things to do"
- Ideas:
  - Transit priority treatments (bus boarding islands/bulb-outs)
  - e-bike purchase incentive
  - Vanpools for non-office workers
- Feedback requested for:
  - How to prioritize VMT reduction measures?
  - Where to focus?
  - Who should sponsor?
  - With whom should VTA also be speaking too?
- Presentation by Karsten Adam, Project Engineer and Gene Gonzalo, Engineering Group Manager on 101/Zanker Road/Skyport Drive/4th Street Improvement Project
- Proposal is to make Zanker Road and 4th Street a new overpass which would allow cars, bikes and pedestrians to cross
- Cost approximately \$350,000,000 with \$20,000,000 already secured
- Three public comments voiced concern that the project is tilted far in favor of cars with "old thinking" about bike infrastructure
- Hassan Basma, Transportation Engineer Manager and Shawn O'Keefe, Consulting Engineer from Mark Thomas presented on the Bascom Avenue Complete Streets (880-Hamilton Avenue) project
- Measure B project with total cost at \$70,000,000
- 3-mile corridor involving Santa Clara County, Caltrans, San Jose County and Campbell
- 65% designed
- VTA wants to hear from the public with more written comments

Public Comment opened at 9:25 p.m.

No speakers.

Public Comment closed at 9:26 p.m.

Commissioner Liu asked about the following:

- Clarify what kind of feedback VTA wants?
- Can the written end of meeting comments be in the agenda packet?

Commissioner Bonne and Ms. Tsang addressed the questions.

Ms. Tsang stated that the Equitable Vehicle Miles Traveled Program focuses on identifying mitigations for development projects.

**STANDING ITEM: CONSIDERATION OF POTENTIAL STUDY ISSUES**

None.

**NON-AGENDA ITEMS & COMMENTS**

**-Commissioner Comments**

Commissioner Hafeman commented on the following:

- Need to have a presentation on Class IIIB networks at a future meeting due to all of the public input

Commissioner Liu commented on the following:

- Have the future Class IIIB agenda item presented by a commissioner or staff and a commissioner

Chair Oey commented on the following:

- Memorial ride for Sarah Muller Modi who was killed in Palo Alto on Sunday, March 24 and for Maria Jaban who was killed on Foothill Boulevard
- April 3/4 - VTA Smart Cycling Class

Commissioner Liu commented on the following:

- May 11, 2024 at 10:00 a.m. - El Camino Real Ride, Santa Clara Caltrain Station to Palo Alto along El Camino Real

**-Staff Comments**

Ms. Wong commented on the following:

- Class I shared-use path is newly opened on the City Hall side of Mathilda Avenue between Olive Avenue and El Camino Real
- Tasman Pedestrian Bicycle Improvement Study online survey open until March 22,

2024 at [Sunnyvale.ca.gov](https://Sunnyvale.ca.gov) search for transportation projects

- April 3 - VTA Safe Routes to School to Homestead Project
- April 20 - Earth Day - Sunnyvale Civic Center Campus from 11 a.m. to 3:00 p.m.
- Deadline to submit Boards and Commission application is April 25 at 4:00 p.m. - recruiting for: Arts Commission, Bicycle and Advisory Commission, Board of Library Trustees, Heritage Preventative Commission, Housing and Human Relations Commission, Parks and Recreation Commission, Personal Board, Planning Commission and Sustainability Commission. More information at [Sunnyvale.ca.gov](https://Sunnyvale.ca.gov), search for Boards and Commissions or call the City Clerks office at 408-730-7483.
- In April the VTA BPAC Sunnyvale representative position is up for renewal. Commissioner Bonne has volunteered to continue being the BPAC representative or will give it up if another commissioner would like to take over

### **INFORMATION ONLY REPORTS/ITEMS**

[24-0508](#) BPAC 2024 Annual Work Plan

Commissioner Liu commented on the following:

- When will the VTA Homestead Road Safe Routes to School Project be on the agenda and why was it postponed?

Ms. Wong stated that it was postponed because they are preparing all the materials for the 35% design. They are collecting all the materials and comments before presenting it to the public. The presentation will be scheduled as soon as possible.

[24-0509](#) Active Items List March 2024

[24-0510](#) 2024 Deferred Study Issues

[24-0511](#) Council Ranking of Study Issues 2024

[24-0512](#) Council Action on Budget Proposals 2024

### **ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Oey adjourned the meeting at 9:44 p.m.