City of Sunnyvale



Meeting Minutes - Final Heritage Preservation Commission

Wednesday, August 1, 2018	7:00 PM	West Conference Room, City Hall, 456 W.
		Olive Ave., Sunnyvale, CA 94086

CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Hopkins called the meeting to order.

SALUTE TO THE FLAG

Vice Chair Hopkins led the salute to the flag.

ROLL CALL

Present: 5 -	Vice Chair Dawn Hopkins
	Commissioner Dixie Larsen
	Commissioner Mike Michitaka
	Commissioner Kenneth Valenzuela
	Commissioner David Wu

PRESENTATION

None

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

None.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1.A.<u>18-0600</u>Approve the Draft Heritage Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes
of June 6, 2018

Commissioner Michitaka made a motion and Commissioner Larsen seconded to approve the Draft Heritage Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes of June 6, 2018, as modified.

- Yes: 4 Vice Chair Hopkins Commissioner Larsen Commissioner Michitaka Commissioner Valenzuela
- **No:** 0

Abstain: 1 - Commissioner Wu

PUBLIC HEARINGS/GENERAL BUSINESS

2. <u>18-0578</u> Proposed Project:

RESOURCE ALTERATION PERMIT: to allow modification to the front facade of the main residence, including a new 6-foot tall gate; and

VARIANCE: to allow an increase of the existing height of the legal and nonconforming detached garage with insufficient side and rear setbacks in the rear yard.

Location: 559 S Taaffe Street (APN: 209-29-043)

File #: 2018-7120

Zoning: R-0/HH

Applicant / Owner: Rob Mayer (applicant) / Sonal Gupta and Apurva P Samudra (owner)

Environmental Review: A Class 1 Categorical Exemption relieves this project from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) provisions that include minor additions to an existing single-family residence (CEQA Section 15301).

Project Planner: Kelly Cha, (408) 730-7408, kcha@sunnyvale.ca.gov

Associate Planner Kelly Cha presented the staff report. She noted that the application is to increase the height of the legal and non-conforming detached garage with substandard side and rear setbacks. She also noted that the plans include a new 6-foot tall driveway gate.

Commissioner Michitaka asked staff about the permit history. Ms. Cha confirmed that a permit to build a second floor was submitted by the previous owner and has since expired.

Commissioner Larsen asked staff about the style and material of the new driveway gate.

Commissioner Wu asked staff to clarify the insufficient setbacks in the side and rear of the detached garage.

Commissioner Larsen asked if there are other driveway gates currently on the same street and Ms. Cha said yes, that there are front yard fences and driveway gates on the same street and within the Heritage District.

Ms. Caliva-Lepe noted that fences are not specifically addressed in the

Taaffe-Frances Neighborhood Design Guidelines. She also added that conditions of approval can be added if the commission felt that the design of the fence impacted the district.

Commissioner Michitaka asked about the Variance and Ms. Cha noted that it addresses the setbacks of the legal non-conforming garage. He also asked staff about the Findings in the report and Ms. Caliva-Lepe clarified the setback requirements of the garage.

Sonal Gupta, owner presented her proposal and said that an extra bathroom is desired for her family and to fix the dilapidated garage that currently has no foundation.

Architect Rob Mayer, applicant on behalf of the owner, further presented their proposal. He noted that they have determined that the best option to keep a garage on the site is to leave it in its current location. He requested that the Commission reconsider Condition of Approval PS-1.a) and not require muttons, or a divided light window, for the new front window. He then noted that he consulted with his historian about the Secretary of Interior Standards about the muttons, who suggested that muttons were not necessary because it helps to differentiate the original home from the existing. Mr. Mayer then discussed the driveway design and planter strip as it transitions to the driveway.

Sonal Gupta, property owner, noted that the reason for the proposed driveway gate is for the safety of her family. Comm. Larsen asked staff to clarify the design and location of the gate.

Comm. Wu asked about the window design in relation to design guidelines. Ms. Caliva-Lepe clarified that staff is recommending the muttons be installed to create a divided light window, which complies with the Taaffe-Frances Heritage Neighborhood Design Guidelines.

Vice Chair Hopkins opened the public hearing.

Ms. Hamilton, property owner south of the subject property, said that she was supportive of the reduced setbacks, portal wall to remain at the existing height, and increased garage height. She agreed with the property owner that carriage-style doors and a divided light window are not needed. Ms. Hamilton also noted other front yard fences in the neighborhood and was supportive of the driveway gate. Steve Caroompas, neighbor, spoke in favor of the project and said that the raised height of the garage would even look better to screen the rear neighbor.

Ms. Cha clarified that the reason behind staff's recommendation to reduce the height of the portal wall was to minimize the increased garage height and non-conformity.

Mike Kapolnek, neighbor to the north, also expressed support for the project and removal of the condition of approval to require the divided light window.

Patrick Hughes, former resident of the subject property, complemented the owner on the design of the garage and agreed that a single-pane window would match a window along the rear elevation. Mr. Hughes also expressed support for the portal wall height to remain and increased garage height.

Patrick McGee and Kathy Harnick, neighbors, also stated their support for the project.

Vice Chair Hopkins closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Valenzuela clarified that the portal wall is partially visible from the street.

Commissioner Larsen asked about the gates and staff clarified that they are wooden gates.

Commissioner Wu asked if there is space for a vehicle in front of the driveway gate and staff confirmed that there is enough space to fit a car and avoid overhang into the public right-of-way.

Commissioner Larsen asked further about the windows and Commissioner Michitaka asked about the alternatives stated on the report.

Commissioner Larsen asked if the existing window facing the street is also divided light. Staff confirmed that there is an existing divided light window facing the street and that the new window, as conditioned by staff to be divided light, will match.

MOTION:

Commissioner Larsen moved and Commissioner Wu seconded the motion for Alternative 2 – Approve the Resource Alteration Permit and Variance with modified conditions, confirming support for PS-1.a) for a divided light window.

FRIENDLY AMENDMENT:

Commissioner Larsen offered a friendly amendment to allow the garage height to be increased by 8 inches in order to maintain the existing attached portal arch, subject to review and approval by the Director of Community Development.

Motion carried as follows:

- Yes: 5 Vice Chair Hopkins Commissioner Larsen Commissioner Michitaka Commissioner Valenzuela Commissioner Wu
- **No:** 0
- 3. **Proposed Project: RESOURCE ALTERATION PERMIT** to consider 18-0678 the historic significance of a single-family home which is listed as part of the Sunnyvale Heritage Resource Inventory. Location: 335 Charles Street (APN: 165-13-037) File #: 2018-7441 Zoning: R-2 (Low Medium Density Residential) Applicant / Owner: Design Discoveries / Steve Caroompas Environmental Review: Environmental review will be conducted as required by the California Environmental Quality Act provisions and City Guidelines upon determination of significance by the Heritage Preservation Commission. Project Planner: Noren Caliva-Lepe, (408) 730-7659, ncaliva-lepe@sunnyvale.ca.gov

Noren Caliva-Lepe presented the report.

Commissioner Wu asked about the unique design of the home and Ms. Caliva-Lepe explained the unique curved bracketed gable described in page 1 of Attachment 3 in the report. She noted that the DPR form states that this curved gable is why it was placed on the Heritage Resource Inventory List.

Commissioner Larsen stated that she believes that the home should have never

been listed as a Heritage Resource.

Commissioner Wu asked staff if there are any Heritage Resources nearby. Ms. Caliva-Lepe noted that there is one other home on Charles that is listed as a Heritage Resource because of the significance of the former occupants of the home.

Ms. Caliva-Lepe noted the background of why the home owner is requesting for the home to be de-listed. Ms. Caliva-Lepe noted that the owner initially was applying for a rear addition.

Owner Steve Caroompas noted his agreement to preserve the existing home and will be applying for a rear addition to address his family's need for an added bedroom.

Dr. Anthony Kirk, historical consultant for the property owner, summarized the history of the property. Dr. Kirk noted that the unique features used to list the property are not consistent with the Craftsman architectural style. Dr. Kirk concluded that the home does not appear to meet the criteria for listing as a Heritage Resource for the reasons noted in the report.

Vice Chair opened the public hearing.

There were no public comments.

Vice Chair Hopkins closed the public hearing.

Comm. Wu asked if there are any responses from the 66 public notices that were mailed and Ms. Caliva-Lepe noted that staff has not received any inquiries or comments about the project.

MOTION:

Comm. Michitaka moved and Comm. Valenzuela seconded the motion for Alternative 1 - Determine that the single-family home does not have local historic significance and recommend that the home be removed from the Sunnyvale Heritage Resource Inventory.

Motion carried as follows:

Yes: 5 -	Vice Chair Hopkins	
	Commissioner Larsen	
	Commissioner Michitaka	
	Commissioner Valenzuela	
	Commissioner Wu	

No: 0

4. 18-0601 Selection of Chair and Vice Chair

Commissioner Michitaka motioned and Commissioner Valenzuela seconded for Vice Chair Hopkins to serve as chair.

> Yes: 4 - Commissioner Larsen Commissioner Michitaka Commissioner Valenzuela Commissioner Wu

No: 0

Abstain: 1 - Vice Chair Hopkins

Commissioner Michitaka motioned and Chair Hopkins seconded for Commissioner Larsen to serve as Vice Chair.

Yes: 4 - Vice Chair Hopkins Commissioner Michitaka Commissioner Valenzuela Commissioner Wu

No: 0

Abstain: 1 - Commissioner Larsen

STANDING ITEM: CONSIDERATION OF POTENTIAL STUDY ISSUES

Comm. Wu gave a presentation about the history of cultural diversity in Sunnyvale. Comm. Wu suggested a study issue to explore minority groups' contributions to the development and history of Sunnyvale. Comm. Wu also recommended that a bicycle map be created or updated with landmark and heritage resources.

Comm. Valenzuela also recommended a study to explore Sunnyvale's involvement in the electronic movement, such as the founding of Atari in Sunnyvale. Chair Hopkins added that a stamp or pin program may be used to encourage residents to visit historic sites. Chair Hopkins was interested in what other cities are doing and how it can be incorporated into the pending plaque program study.

Comm. Michitaka acknowledged budget constraints for study issues and expressed support for the completion of the Murphy Avenue Design Guidelines.

Councilmember Melton introduced himself as the liaison to the commission for the next six months and encouraged the commission to continue to put forth study issue ideas.

Ms. Caliva-Lepe noted that she will draft the discussed study issue proposals for ranking later in the year.

NON-AGENDA ITEMS & COMMENTS

-Commissioner Comments

None.

INFORMATION ONLY REPORTS/ITEMS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Hopkins adjourned the meeting at 9:00 p.m.