



City of Sunnyvale

Agenda Item-No Attachments (PDF)

File #: 15-0861, Version: 1

REPORT TO THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

File #: 2015-7699

Location: 568 South Frances Street (APN: 209-30-020)

Applicant / Owner: Efrat Barak (applicant and owner)

Proposed Project:

RESOURCE ALTERATION PERMIT to allow a 497-square foot addition to the rear of an existing single family home and the modification of the roof from a flat roof to a pitched roof (main residence and garage) in the Taaffe Frances Heritage Neighborhood. The total proposed floor area is 1,528 square feet (23.5% FAR) including the detached single car garage.

Reason for Permit: A Resource Alteration Permit is required for major alterations to a Heritage Resource.

Project Planner: Momoko Ishijima, (408) 730-7532, mishijima@sunnyvale.ca.gov

Issues: Compatibility with Taaffe-Frances Heritage District Design Guidelines

Recommendation: Approve with conditions

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes a 498-square foot addition to the rear of an existing single family home and the modification of the roof from a flat roof to a pitched roof (main residence and garage) in the Taaffe-Frances Heritage Neighborhood. Total floor area is 1,728 square feet (27% Floor Area Ratio) with the detached single car garage. No trees are proposed for removal.

A Resource Alteration Permit is required for any major alterations to a Heritage Resource.

Background

The project site is located mid-block on the east side of South Frances Street between West El Camino Real and West Olive Avenue. The surrounding uses are single-family residences to the north, south, and west. A law office is located to the east of the property on South Murphy Street. The existing residence is a Spanish style cottage constructed in 1928 with a flat roof. The existing residence is 1,030 square feet and the garage is 200 square feet.

The project site is located within the Taaffe-Frances Heritage Neighborhood with a zoning of R0-HH (Low Density Residential, Heritage Housing Combining District). This neighborhood is one of the oldest in Sunnyvale with a concentration of homes constructed between the 1920's and the 1940's. The architectural styles are rich, unique, and vary in range from, and not limited to, Craftsman Bungalow, English Tudor, Traditional Ranch, Colonial Revival, and Spanish Revival. The original

character of the streets remain intact from the original Pal Jose subdivision in 1925. The lots are typically 50 feet wide and 130 feet in depth with a long driveway typically leading to a detached garage in the rear of the property. On March 24, 2009, the City Council adopted the Taaffe-Frances Heritage Neighborhood Design Guidelines (Design Guidelines), recognizing this neighborhood as exemplifying “a part of Sunnyvale’s cultural, social, political and architectural history.” The purpose of the HH combining district and the design guidelines is to provide a higher level of protection than other single-family homes and to preserve, enhance and perpetuate the historical neighborhood. All alterations of homes in the neighborhood must be evaluated for conformance with the established design guidelines.

Architecture

The existing residence is a Spanish Revival style with a flat roof form for both the residence and detached garage. As noted in the Neighborhood Context section of the Design Guidelines, the distinguishing features of the Spanish Revival style architecture are:

- Low pitch roofs
- Red tile roofs
- Small roof overhangs
- Asymmetrical facades
- Stucco walls
- Prominent chimneys
- Uniquely shaped wing walls
- Decorative stucco or tile roof vents
- Applied decorative details and grilles

The roof alteration proposed at the project site does not reduce the distinguishing characteristics of the Spanish Revival style as the proposed new roofs would be low pitch with red tiles. Other existing characteristics would be retained, such as, stucco walls, recessed entry, prominent chimney, uniquely shaped wing wall, applied decorative details. Some other proposed alterations further enhance the Spanish Revival style with the replacement of the front door, gridded windows, window shutters, and garage door with darker wood doors. The proposed alteration reinforces the prevailing neighborhood patterns, respects the scale and bulk of the neighborhood and would apply quality materials in the project.

The proposed 498-square foot addition is in the rear of the house to add a new master bedroom and bathroom and to expand the kitchen and associated living areas. The single-story addition is not visible from the public right-of-way and would be consistent with side setbacks of the existing residence. The addition increases the bedrooms from two bedrooms to three bedrooms, one bathroom to two bathrooms, and opens the kitchen area up to create a more functional “great room” space. The proposed addition to the existing residence complies with all development standards of the R0 zoning district.

The proposed project supports the following Taaffe-Frances Heritage Neighborhood Design Guidelines Design Principles and Guidelines:

Design Principles

- B. Respect the scale, bulk and character of homes in the neighborhood
- C. Design homes to respect their immediate neighbors
- E. Design homes with architectural integrity
- F. Use high quality materials and craftsmanship
- G. Preserve mature landscaping

Design Guidelines

3.1 - Planning for a Ground Floor Addition

- 3.1.1 Locate ground level additions at the rear of the existing house
- 3.1.4 Design additions and garages to be sympathetic to the architectural style, materials, and details of the existing house.
- 3.3.2 Match the original house materials and details.
- 3.3.5 Use building materials that are authentic to the architectural style and neighborhood.
- 3.4.4 Use architectural and decorative details that are common to the neighborhood.
 - Divided light windows
 - Wood window trim
 - Decorative metal details on Spanish-style homes
 - Wood shutters

Neighborhood Impacts / Compatibility

The applicant proposes to alter the roof form to a pitched style for both the home and the garage. There are a number of Spanish Revival style homes in the neighborhood as well as on the adjacent South Murphy Avenue and South Sunnyvale Avenue. The roof forms of these homes vary between flat and pitched or a combination of pitched and flat. The alteration of the roof form at the project site would not diminish the prevalence of flat roofed homes in the neighborhood.

Total No. of Lots in the Taaffe-Frances Heritage Neighborhood	58
No. of Spanish Revival style homes	11
No. of homes with flat roofs	5
No. of homes with a combination of flat and pitched roofs	6
No. of Spanish Revival style homes with a flat or combination flat/pitched roof	9

The two homes across South Frances Avenue from the project site are flat, one home with Spanish Revival architecture and one home with Moderne style architecture. The adjacent Spanish Revival home to the left side was approved for a second story addition with some part of the roof on both the first and second floor incorporating a flat style. If the project is approved as proposed there would be eight remaining Spanish Revival style homes in the neighborhood with a flat or a combination of flat and pitched roof in the neighborhood which is approximately 14% of all homes in the heritage

neighborhood.

Garage and Parking

The existing single-car garage is located in the rear of the property with a rear setback of approximately 4.5 feet and a side setback of 2.5 feet. The prevailing site layout of the properties in the neighborhood is the location of detached garages in the back of the property with a 10-foot wide driveway along the side property line. Parking is typically hidden from public view and not the focal point of the streetscape. The required parking for a single family residence is two covered parking spaces and two uncovered parking spaces. The proposed addition to the residence does not trigger an upgrade of the one-car garage to a two-car garage (less than 1,800 square feet and less than four bedrooms).

The applicant proposes to change the roof form of the garage from a flat style to a pitched style to match the roof changes proposed for the main residence. The height of the garage would be increased from 8 feet five inches to 12 feet seven inches.

The Municipal Code requires nonconforming structures to be brought into conformance with the development standards if the nonconformity is increased. The increase in height to the garage would be considered an increase to the nonconformity and would require a Variance approval. Although the Variance approval is not under the purview of the Heritage Preservation Commission and would require a separate action by the Zoning Administrator at an Administrative Public Hearing; the Heritage Preservation Commission is requested to provide recommendations of the appropriateness of the modification of the roof from flat to a pitched roof form.

The proposed project supports the following Taaffe-Frances Heritage Neighborhood Design Guidelines Design Principles and Guidelines:

Design Principles

- D. Minimize the visual impacts of parking.

Design Guidelines

3.1.4 - Design additions and garages to be sympathetic to the architectural style, materials, and details of the existing house.

- a) The character of any addition or alteration should be in keeping with and subordinate to the integrity of the original structure.

3.1.5 - Plan and design structures near the rear property line with care.

- a) Avoid bulky forms, heights and window placements that would impact the privacy of adjacent residents.

Landscaping

The project site has a protected redwood tree in the rear of the property. The tree would be retained and appropriate tree protection and construction methods would be required to be implemented.

(Attachment 4)

Public Contact: 113 notices were sent to surrounding property owners and residents adjacent to the subject site in addition to standard noticing practices, including advertisement in the Sunnyvale Sun Newspaper and on-site posting. One letter was received from a neighbor and has been included as an attachment (Attachment 7).

Environmental Determination: A Mitigated Negative Declaration has been prepared in compliance with California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) provisions and City guidelines (see Initial Study Attachment 5). An Initial Study determined that construction of the proposed project has the potential to result in significant effects on short term noise (construction noise). Implementing mitigation measures during construction will reduce these impacts to less than significant. The Mitigation Measures have been incorporated as Conditions of Approval (see Attachment 4).

CONCLUSION

Findings and General Plan Goals: Staff was able to make the required Findings for the Resource Alteration Permit and Variance. Recommended Findings and General Plan Goals and Policies are located in Attachment 3.

ALTERNATIVES

1. Approve the Resource Alteration Permit with recommended Conditions in Attachment
2. Approve the Resource Alteration Permit with modifications.
3. Deny the Resource Alteration Permit.

RECOMMENDATION

Alternative 1. Approve the Resource Alteration Permit with recommended Conditions in Attachment 2.

Prepared by: Momoko Ishijima, Associate Planner

Approved by: Gerri Caruso, Principal Planner

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity and Noticing Maps
2. Project Data Table
3. Recommended Findings
4. Recommended Conditions of Approval
5. Site and Architectural Plans
6. Mitigated Negative Declaration
7. Letter from Neighbors