

# City of Sunnyvale

## Agenda Item-No Attachments (PDF)

File #: 19-0704, Version: 1

#### REPORT TO COUNCIL

### **SUBJECT**

Adopt a resolution to adopt the Climate Action Playbook, including greenhouse gas reduction targets of 56 Percent by 2030 and 80 Percent by 2050, and Find that the Addendum to the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) of the General Plan's Land Use and Transportation Element (LUTE) Prepared for the Playbook is Consistent with CEQA Pursuant to Guidelines Sections 15168 and 15183

### SUMMARY OF KEY CHANGES TO PLAYBOOK

The Climate Action Playbook was intended to be a Playbook designed by the community for the community. For this reason, public feedback has been an integral component of staff's approach in revising the Playbook to its current version - the Revised Final Playbook (Attachment 3). Below is a summary of the key changes made from the Draft Playbook, to the Proposed Final Playbook, to the Revised Final Playbook. These changes are also summarized in tabulated form in Attachment 4.

### **Draft Playbook**

The Draft Playbook was released for public review in March 2019. The Draft Playbook aimed to achieve overall GHG reductions of:

- 60 percent by 2030, and
- 80 percent (carbon neutrality) by 2050.

The Draft Playbook noted that it was critical to exceed the state's 2030 target of a 40 percent below 1990 levels in order to achieve the longer term state target of 80 percent below 1990 levels by 2050.

### **Proposed Final Playbook**

After reviewing feedback gathered from the community, CAC, Commissions, and City Council during March and April 2019, staff presented the Proposed Final Playbook to the CAC and Commissions at meetings in July. The Proposed Final Playbook aimed to achieve overall GHG reductions of:

- 55 percent by 2030, and
- 80 percent by 2050.

The key changes aligned with the above targets and reflected in the Proposed Final Playbook were:

- Accelerate all-electric new buildings: 2030 target for Play 2.3 revised to 100 percent all-electric new buildings, versus previous target of 2050 for all-electric new buildings.
- Adjust vehicle miles targets downward: Targets for vehicle miles travelled per person scaled downward to align better to related Plays, such that the targets are ambitious and also attainable. New targets are 13 percent reduction in vehicle miles per person by 2030 (previously 37 percent reduction by 2030) and 25 percent reduction in vehicle miles per person by 2050 (previously 47 percent reduction by 2030), measured relative to 2016 vehicle miles per person.

### **Revised Final Playbook**

After reviewing the recommendation made by the CAC and the Commissions in July 2019, staff is

now presenting the Revised Final Playbook, which aims to achieve overall GHG reductions of:

- 56 percent by 2030, and
- 80 percent by 2050.

The key change reflected in the Revised Final Playbook it changing the 2030 target for Plays 3.1 and 3.2 from a 13 percent reduction in vehicle miles per person to a 20 percent reduction in vehicle miles per person. The 2050 target was not changed from the Proposed Final to the Revised Final Playbook.

### **SUMMARY OF COMMISSION ACTION**

The Sustainability Commission and the Climate Action Plan (CAP 2.0) Advisory Committee (CAC) considered this item at a joint meeting on July 15, 2019.

The Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Commission (BPAC) considered this item at a public hearing on July 18, 2019.

The Planning Commission considered this item at a public hearing on July 22, 2019.

The RTC presented to the Planning Commission, RTC No. 19-0703, is presented in Attachment 1 of this report. (To view attachments to RTC No. 19-0703, see the Planning Commission's July 22, 2019 meeting agenda). The RTC presented to the CAC, Sustainability Commission, and BPAC (RTC 19-0494) is identical to RTC No. 19-0703 for the Planning Commission, with the exception of the Environmental Review, which was not included in RTC No. 19-0494. This is because the Environmental Review was still in progress during those initial meetings, and also since the CAC, Sustainability Commission, and BPAC do not evaluate projects for their environmental impacts in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

The CAC and Commissions made several similar recommendations. To reduce redundancy in this report, modifications proposed by each Committee or Commission have been numbered and are cross-referenced within the following hearing summaries.

### Climate Action Plan (CAP 2.0) Advisory Committee (CAC) Hearing

The CAC voted 9-0 (two CAC members absent) to approve Alternative 3 to forward a recommendation to City Council to adopt the Climate Action Playbook, with the modifications as shown in Table 1. An excerpt of the meeting minutes is included with this report (Attachment 9).

### Sustainability Commission Hearing

The Sustainability Commission voted 6-0 (one Commissioner absent) to approve Alternative 3 to forward a recommendation to City Council to adopt the Climate Action Playbook, with the same modifications as those proposed by the CAC (see Table 1). An excerpt of the meeting minutes is included with this report (Attachment 10).

### **Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Commission (BPAC) Hearing**

The BPAC voted 5-0 (one Commissioner absent) to approve Alternative 3 to forward a recommendation to City Council to adopt the Climate Action Playbook, including some of the modifications recommended by the CAC and Sustainability Commission as well as some additional modifications (Table 1). An excerpt of the meeting minutes is included with this report (Attachment

11).

### **Planning Commission Hearing**

The Planning Commission voted 5-0 (one Commissioner absent) to approve Alternative 3 to forward a recommendation to City Council to adopt the Climate Action Playbook, including all the modifications recommended by the CAC, Sustainability Commission, and BPAC as well as some additional modifications (Table 1), and to find that the Addendum to the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) of the General Plan's Land Use and Transportation Element (LUTE) prepared for the Playbook is consistent with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Sections 15168 and 15183. An excerpt of the meeting minutes is included with this report (Attachment 12).

Table 1. Recommended Modifications Proposed by CAC and Commissions

	rable 1. Recommended modifications 1 roposed by OAO and Commissions								
Item No.	Modifications Recommended by CAC/Commissions	Proposed Final Playbook as presented to CAC/Commissions	Recommended Modifications to Proposed Final Playbook	Meeting Body	Staff Recommendation				
1	Set higher more ambitious targets at the Play-level and overall. Specifically:								
1.a	Revise 2030 target for Play 1.3	1% of electricity demand stored in batteries locally	2% of electricity demand stored in batteries locally	CAC, SC, PC	Support				
1.b	Revise 2030 target for Plays 3.1 and 3.2	13% reduction in vehicle miles per person	20% reduction in vehicle miles per person (see item 1e for the impact of this change on the overall 2030 target)	CAC, SC, BPAC, PC	Support				
1.c	Revise 2050 target for Plays 3.1 and 3.2	25% reduction in vehicle miles per person	40% reduction in vehicle miles per person (see item 1e for the impact of this change on the overall 2030 target)	CAC, SC, BPAC, PC	Do not support				
1.d	Revise 2050 target for Play 4.1	Reduce landfilled garbage to 1 lb per person per day	Reduce landfilled garbage to <1 lb per person per day	CAC, SC, PC	Support				
1.e	Revise 2030 overall target to 56% below 1990 levels, based on modifications to Play-level targets	55% below 1990	56.3% below 1990	CAC, SC, PC	Support				
1.f	Revise 2050 overall target to 82% below 1990 levels, based on modifications to Play-level targets	80% below 1990	81.5% below 1990	CAC, SC, PC	Do not support				

Meeting bodies: CAC - CAP 2.0 Advisory Committee; SC - Sustainability Commission; BPAC - Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Commission; and PC - Planning Commission

Item No.	Modifications Recommended by CAC/Commissions	Proposed Final Playbook as presented to CAC/Commissions	Recommended  Modifications to Proposed  Final Playbook	Meeting Body	Staff Recommendation
2	Revise language for Move 2.E to include a date	Evaluate code and permitting processes to streamline building electrification	Evaluate code and permitting processes to streamline building electrification to achieve 100% all-electric permits by 2023	CAC, SC, PC	Do not support
3	Revise language for Play 3.1	Balance land use supply and enhance urban form	Enhance colocation of different land uses to reduce vehicle miles per person	CAC, SC, PC	Support
4	Revise language for Play 4.4 to broaden to all types of consumption beyond food	Promote sustainable food choices	Promote sustainable consumption	CAC, SC, PC	Support
5	Revise language for Move 4.F to emphasize its importance	Implement the City's Urban Forest Management Plan and continue to protect and expand tree canopy	Fund and implement the City's Urban Forest Management Plan and continue to protect and expand tree canopy	CAC, SC, PC	Do not support
6	Add language to emphasize that each department working on Moves reports periodically on its Playbook implementation plan and progress to Council to inform future development and implementation of Next Moves in subsequent Game Plans	n/a	n/a	CAC, SC, PC	Support
7	Add special emphasis to the following Moves: 3.A (additional housing), 3.B (parking), and 3.E (update and implement Bike/Ped/SRTS Plan)	n/a	n/a	BPAC, PC	Support
8	Revise language for Move 3.A to emphasize increasing infill development	Plan for additional housing, with the goal of diverse housing, to reduce long- distance commutes	Plan for additional housing, with the goal of diverse housing and maximizing infill development, to reduce long- distance commutes	PC	Do not support
9	Revise language for Move 3.B to specifically reference reforming residential minimum parking requirements to reduce VMT	Identify areas that are most appropriate for parking strategies that discourage vehicle use, such as pricing, time limits and supply reductions	Identify areas that are most appropriate for parking strategies that discourage vehicle use, such as pricing, time limits, supply reductions, and reforming residential parking requirements	PC	Do not support
10	Revise language for Move 4.F to emphasize greatly expanding the tree canopy to enhance carbon sequestration	Implement the City's Urban Forest Management Plan and continue to protect and expand tree canopy	Implement the City's Urban Forest Management Plan and continue to protect and greatly expand the tree canopy	PC	Support

#### **Discussion of Recommended Modifications**

Staff is generally supportive of Modification Items 1a, 1b, 1d, 1e, 3, 4, 6, 7, and 10 proposed by the CAC and Commissions as they improve upon the Proposed Playbook while recognizing that some of them are reach targets. These modifications are reflected in the Revised Final Climate Action Playbook document (included with Attachment 3). The final proposed language for Modification Items 3 and 4 was modified for clarity.

Staff does not support the remaining modifications for the following reasons:

#### Modification Item 1c and 1f:

For Plays 3.1 and 3.2, staff has incorporated the CAC's and Commissions' proposed modification 1b to the 2030 target (i.e., 20 percent reduction in vehicle miles per person), recognizing that this is a reach target that will be challenging for the City to achieve. Staff does not support modifying the 2050 target to 40 percent reduction in vehicle miles per person, per Modification Item 1c, because:

- City's influence over Vehicles Miles Traveled (VMT) is limited: The modeling for VMT targets was conducted by the City's technical consultant and is dependent on 15 variables or trends. These 15 trends include vehicle ownership, bicycle/pedestrian network, transportation demand management strategies, and densification, among others. Of these, the four trends that most strongly influence VMT in the underlying model are: local labor force participation, vehicle ownership costs, housing affordability, and ridesharing. These four trends are heavily influenced by regional or market trends and are largely beyond the City's control. Therefore, the City's ability to influence VMT to such a large extent is limited.
- Reducing VMT in a high "clean vehicle scenario" yields limited GHG benefits: The 2050 target Play 3.3 is to have 75 percent of all vehicles be zero emission vehicles. Reducing VMT significantly in 2050, therefore, has limited impact as most of the VMT come from zero emission vehicles, which have no emissions.

For these reasons, staff recommends maintaining the 2050 target at a 25 percent reduction in vehicle miles per person.

Correspondingly, staff does not support changing the overall target of reducing GHG emissions by 82 percent by 2050, per Modification Item 1f. The 2050 target is proposed to be maintained at 80 percent by 2050.

#### Modification Item 2

Staff is already exploring the possibility of adopting Reach Codes to encourage building electrification, which serves as a pathway towards eventually achieving all-electric buildings. Reach Codes allow a gradual progression towards all-electric buildings, which encourages market transformation and enables developers to eventually be in a position to have all-electric buildings by 2030. Adding a specific date of 2023 to Move 2.E before significant community and stakeholder outreach is conducted may be premature. Therefore, staff does not support Modification Item 2.

#### Modification Item 5

The Urban Forest Management Plan (Move 4.F) is partially funded as of the adoption of the FY 2019/20 Recommended Budget. Funding decisions are made separately from the development of the Moves, as a part of Council's annual budget deliberations. Therefore, staff does not support Modification Item 5.

#### Modification Item 8

Specifically referencing infill development in Move 3.A is not necessary for Sunnyvale where all development is infill, given that the City is largely built out. Therefore, staff does not support Modification Item 8.

#### Modification Item 9

The wording "supply reductions" in Move 3.B already reflects potentially reforming residential parking. Therefore, staff does not support Modification Item 9.

#### PUBLIC CONTACT

Public contact was made by posting the Council agenda on the City's official-notice bulletin board outside City Hall, at the Sunnyvale Senior Center, Community Center and Department of Public Safety; and by making the agenda and report available at the Sunnyvale Public Library, the Office of the City Clerk and on the City's website.

### **ALTERNATIVES**

- Adopt a Resolution (Attachment 8) to adopt the Climate Action Playbook (Attachment 3), including
  the greenhouse gas reduction targets of 56 percent by 2030 and 80 percent by 2050, and Find
  that the Addendum to the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) of the General Plan's Land Use and
  Transportation Element (LUTE) Prepared for the Playbook is Consistent with CEQA Pursuant to
  Guidelines Sections 15168 and 15183.
- 2. Adopt a Resolution (Attachment 8) to adopt the Climate Action Playbook (Attachment 3), including the greenhouse gas reduction targets of 56 percent by 2030 and 80 percent by 2050, with modifications, and Find that the Addendum to the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) of the General Plan's Land Use and Transportation Element (LUTE) Prepared for the Playbook is Consistent with CEQA Pursuant to Guidelines Sections 15168 and 15183.
- 3. Take no action and provide staff direction on what modifications to be included in the Climate Action Playbook.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends Alternative 1: Adopt a Resolution (Attachment 8) to adopt the Climate Action Playbook (Attachment 3), including the greenhouse gas reduction targets of 56 percent by 2030 and 80 percent by 2050, and Find that the Addendum to the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) of the General Plan's Land Use and Transportation Element (LUTE) Prepared for the Playbook is Consistent with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Sections 15168 and 15183.

The Climate Action Playbook provides a pathway to exceed the State's 2030 target by achieving a 56 percent reduction below 1990 levels, and achieving the State's 2050 target of an 80 percent reduction below 1990 levels. These bold targets are aimed to inspire and guide the City and community in achieving significant GHG reductions. The Playbook demonstrates a broad commitment to collaboration across the City organization, with and within the community, and across agencies.

Furthermore, the Playbook constitutes a project under the California Environmental Quality Act but does not pose significant environmental impacts. It serves to update greenhouse gas emissions projections based on the growth projections of the General Plan's Land Use and Transportation Element (2017), as required by the LUTE EIR.

Adoption of the Playbook also completes Study Issue ESD 18-01 (Encouraging Heat Pump Water and Space Heating), which was presented to the City Council at a Study Session on November 27, 2018 (See Study Session Summary Report RTC No. 18-1084). Council expressed interest in exploring the possibility of requiring heat pumps or having all-electric requirements for new construction and expressed support for staff's next steps to include heat pumps as a part of the Playbook. In alignment with the Council direction provided at this Study Session, staff has committed to pursuing the expansion of heat pump technologies via Move 2.C (Develop a program to accelerate the adoption of heat pump water heaters and space heaters) of Game Plan 2022.

Prepared by: Nupur Hiremath, Environmental Programs Manager

Reviewed by: Melody Tovar, Regulatory Programs Division Manager

Reviewed by: Ramana Chinnakotla, Director of Environmental Services Department

Reviewed by: Trudi Ryan, Director of Community Development Department

Reviewed by: Chip Taylor, Director of Department of Public Works

Reviewed by: Rebecca Moon, Senior Assistant City Attorney

Reviewed by: John Nagel, City Attorney

Reviewed by: Teri Silva, Assistant City Manager

Approved by: Kent Steffens, City Manager

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

- 1. Report to Planning Commission [No. 19-0703, July 22, 2019]
- 2. Addendum to LUTE EIR and CEQA Checklist August 2019
- 3. Revised Final Climate Action Playbook August 2019
- 4. At-A-Glance: Key Changes between Draft, Proposed, and Revised Final Playbooks
- 5. At-A-Glance: Climate Action Playbook with Game Plan 2022 August 2019
- 6. Snapshot of Public Feedback
- 7. Compilation of Public Feedback
- 8. Resolution August 2019
- 9. Excerpt of Draft Minutes of the CAC Joint Special Meeting of July 15, 2019
- 10. Excerpt of Draft Minutes of the Sustainability Commission Joint Special Meeting of July 15, 2019
- 11. Excerpt of Draft Minutes of the Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Commission Meeting of July 18, 2019
- 12. Excerpt of Draft Action Summary of the Planning Commission Meeting of July 22, 2019